

J. Phillip Carver  
General Attorney

Southern Bell Telephone  
and Telegraph Company  
c/o Marshall M. Criser III  
Suite 400  
150 So. Monroe Street  
Tallahassee, Florida 32301  
Phone (305) 530-5558

June 26, 1992

Mr. Steve C. Tribble  
Director, Division of Records and Reporting  
Florida Public Service Commission  
101 East Gaines Street  
Tallahassee, Florida 32301

Re: Staff's 16th Request for Production of Documents  
Docket No. 910163-TL - Repair Service Investigation

Dear Mr. Tribble:

Enclosed please find an original and fifteen copies of Southern Bell Telephone and Telegraph Company's Request for Confidential Classification and Motion for Permanent Protective Order, which we ask that you file in the captioned docket.

A copy of this letter is enclosed. Please mark it to indicate that the original was filed and return the copy to me. Copies have been served to the parties shown on the attached Certificate of Service.

Sincerely yours,

*J. Phillip Carver*  
J. Phillip Carver  
(22)

Enclosures

cc: All Parties of Record  
Harris R. Anthony  
A. M. Lombardo  
R. Douglas Lackey

RECEIVED & FILED

EPSC BUREAU OF RECORDS

Note: DN 6895-92 for BELL SOUTH Company  
Forwarded to CMU

16274-92  
x-ref 5929-92  
DOCUMENT NUMBER-DATE  
06894 JUN 26 1992  
FPSC-RECORDS/REPORTING

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**  
**Docket No. 910163-TL**

I HEREBY CERTIFY that a copy of the foregoing has been  
furnished by United States Mail this <sup>26<sup>th</sup></sup> day of *June*, 1992,  
to:

Charles J. Beck  
Assistant Public Counsel  
Office of the Public Counsel  
111 W. Madison Street  
Room 812  
Tallahassee, FL 32399-1400

Tracy Hatch  
Division of Legal Services  
Florida Public Svc. Commission  
101 East Gaines Street  
Tallahassee, FL 32399-0863

*J. Phillip Carter*

BEFORE THE FLORIDA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In re: Petition on behalf of Citizens ) Docket No. 910163-TL  
of the State of Florida to initiate )  
investigation into integrity of ) Filed: June 26, 1992  
Southern Bell Telephone and Telegraph )  
Company's repair service activities )  
and reports. )  
\_\_\_\_\_ )

**SOUTHERN BELL TELEPHONE AND TELEGRAPH COMPANY'S  
REQUEST FOR CONFIDENTIAL CLASSIFICATION  
AND MOTION FOR PERMANENT PROTECTIVE ORDER**

COMES NOW BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc., d/b/a Southern Bell Telephone and Telegraph Company ("Southern Bell" or "Company"), pursuant to Rule 25-22.006, Florida Administrative Code, and files its Request for Confidential Classification and Motion for Permanent Protective Order regarding certain information provided to the Florida Public Service Commission ("Commission") Staff in response to its Sixteenth Request for Production of Documents in this docket.

1. On May 1, 1992, Staff served its Sixteenth Request for Production of Documents. On June 5, 1992, Southern Bell filed its response to this request, including a Notice of Intent to Request Confidential Classification. Consistent with the rules of the Commission, Southern Bell then provided to the Commission Staff the responsive documents, including the material for which specified confidential treatment is now requested. In accord with Rule 25-22.006, Florida Administrative Code, Southern Bell

DOCUMENT NUMBER-DATE  
06894 JUN 26 1992  
FPSC-RECORDS/REPORTING

now files its Request for Confidential Classification and Motion for Permanent Protective Order for certain information contained in the responses provided to the Staff's Sixteenth Request for Production of Documents. Southern Bell herein requests confidential classification of the names of the employees who have been disciplined.

2. Southern Bell has filed a highlighted version of the documents responsive to the Sixteenth Request in a sealed container, which is marked as Attachment "A." Southern Bell has also filed two redacted copies of these documents as Attachment "B." Finally, Southern Bell has filed as Attachment "C" a listing of specific pages and lines of the documents that contain proprietary confidential information, all of which are confidential for the reasons set forth below.

3. Southern Bell seeks confidential treatment only of the specific identities of the employees disciplined. This information is clearly confidential and proprietary under Florida Statutes, § 364.183(f), which provides that "proprietary confidential business information" includes "employee personnel information unrelated to compensation, duties, qualifications, or responsibilities."

4. The four areas of employee personnel information that are not confidential pursuant to § 364.183(f), Florida Statutes,

are compensation, duties, qualifications, and responsibilities of an employee. Employee discipline does not fit any of the exceptions and thus is confidential under § 364.183(f), Florida Statutes.

5. A review of these terms, in the context of § 364.183(f), Florida Statutes, reveals their meaning.

"Compensation" is the amount of money or other value that an employee is paid to perform his or her job duties. "Duties" are the particular acts an employee is expected to perform as a part of his or her job. "Qualifications" are the skills, knowledge, and abilities needed to perform a particular job. Finally, "responsibilities" are those things that an employee is obliged to do as part of his or her job. These meanings are confirmed by the dictionary definition of these words. Webster's definitions of these terms are as follow:

- A. Compensation - payment, wages.
- B. Duty - the action required by one's position or occupation.
- C. Qualification - something that qualifies; a condition that must be complied with.
- D. Responsibility - the quality or state of being responsible.

Webster's Seventh New Collegiate Dictionary, 1970. A reading of these commonly-understood definitions makes it clear that the

disciplining of an employee is not encompassed within any of the concepts or definitions set forth above.

6. The names of the employees who have been disciplined, therefore, do not relate to their compensation, duties, qualifications, or responsibilities. Instead, the name of an employee who has been disciplined is a personnel-related matter, the disclosure of which would be highly damaging to the reputation of the employee in the community at large. Certainly, § 364.183, Florida Statutes, was not intended to require such disclosure.

7. If this Commission were to interpret § 364.183, Florida Statutes, to require public disclosure of the name of a disciplined employee, then there would be nothing protected from disclosure. Put another way, a broad reading of the exceptions to 364.183(f), Florida Statutes, would reduce the public disclosure exemption for employee information to the point of nonexistence. Obviously, if the legislature had intended for this statute to be read in a way that would make the employee information exemption uniformly unavailable and essentially pointless, then it would simply not have bothered to create the exemption in the first place.

8. In this particular case, though, there is an equally compelling reason that these documents should be treated as

confidential. Section 364.183, Florida Statutes, provides that in addition to the specifically identified types of documents that are confidential, such as those enumerated in subsection (f), any document that, if disclosed, "would cause harm to the ratepayers or the person's or company's business operations...is also entitled to protection." The potential for harm to Southern Bell's business operations that would result from disclosure of the subject information is great.

9. The discipline of Southern Bell's employees in this matter was the result of a thorough, privileged internal investigation that was designed to determine whether or not a repair reporting problem existed. The level of any disciplinary action that was taken was based upon the magnitude of the actions of the particular employees in question. It was never contemplated by either the Company or the individuals involved that, in the aftermath of this effort by Southern Bell to police itself, there would be a subsequent public disclosure that would subject the disciplined employees to the additional punishment of public opprobrium and scorn. In effect, any public disclosure of the names of the disciplined employees would convert internal discipline into an inappropriate and inflammatory "public shaming" of these employees.

10. Inasmuch as this docket already has resulted in widespread publicity as to Southern Bell, it is probable that the public disclosure of the identities of these employees would also be widely published. This exposure is unnecessary where, as here, the press will have access to all disciplinary information, except for the names of the employees themselves. Thus, for example, the number of employees disciplined, the basis for the discipline and the type of discipline would all be publicly available.

11. The public disclosure of the names of disciplined employees would have a significantly deleterious effect on morale that, in turn, would serve as a practical impediment to the functioning of the Company. Those who have cooperated with the efforts of the company to police itself have done so on the well-founded assumption that the information would be handled discreetly, appropriately, and that it would result in discipline that was warranted. If Southern Bell is now forced to reveal publicly the names of the employees disciplined, then the employees who have cooperated will no doubt feel that their good faith efforts to address any problems that may have occurred have been betrayed. It is easy to see how this sense of betrayal could result in morale problems that would be both widespread and severe.



12. Moreover, public disclosure could well result not only in general morale problems, but also in a general employee wariness and concern that would make future attempts to remedy problems far more difficult. Southern Bell can only effectively investigate an internal problem with the cooperation of its employees. If the lesson to be learned by employees in this particular instance is that any cooperation may result in exposure of disciplined employees to the additional ordeal of public ridicule, then the prospect of obtaining adequate employee cooperation to address effectively any future problems diminishes significantly.

13. Further, the managers of Southern Bell who are charged with the duty of administering employee discipline will unquestionably be hesitant to do so if they know that any employee disciplined for even the most minor infraction may later have that discipline disclosed and widely published.

14. Finally, to reveal this information publicly would serve no purpose whatsoever. Arguably, if disclosure of the identities of these employees served some public purpose, or if this disclosure were necessary for this Commission to deal thoroughly with the issues of this docket, then a balancing test might be necessary. That is, the Commission would need to balance the benefits to be derived from public disclosure against

the detriment to the Company and the employees. In this case, however, public disclosure will result in no benefit whatsoever.


15. This Commission can fully consider all issues pertinent to this docket, based on the information that Southern Bell has provided, which includes the names of employees disciplined. It is only the public disclosure of these employees' names that Southern Bell seeks to prevent. Southern Bell has stated that it does not object to public disclosure of the extent of the employee discipline, the type of discipline, and the number of persons disciplined. There simply is nothing to be gained by the additional, public disclosure of the identities of the particular persons disciplined. Florida Statutes § 364.183(f) clearly provides that the names of these employees should be kept confidential. To hold otherwise will do nothing more than damage, perhaps irreparably, the reputations of individual Southern Bell employees and expose them personally to public ridicule.


16. All of the information for which Southern Bell requests confidential treatment is intended to be treated as confidential, has been treated as confidential and has not been disclosed to any third party except pursuant to statutory provisions or private agreement that provides that the information will not be released to the public.

WHEREFORE, Southern Bell requests that the Commission grant its Request for Confidential Classification and Motion for Permanent Protective Order.

Respectfully submitted,

ATTORNEYS FOR SOUTHERN BELL  
TELEPHONE AND TELEGRAPH COMPANY

  
HARRIS R. ANTHONY (22)  
J. PHILLIP CARVER  
c/o Marshall M. Criser III  
150 So. Monroe Street  
Suite 400  
Tallahassee, Florida 32301  
(305) 530-5555

  
R. DOUGLAS LACKEY (22)  
NANCY B. WHITE  
4300 Southern Bell Center  
675 W. Peachtree St., NE  
Atlanta, Georgia 30375  
(404) 529-3862

**ATTACHMENT C**

**JUSTIFICATION FOR CONFIDENTIALITY REQUEST**

The confidential and proprietary information that is contained in this listing is all employee-personnel information that is not related to qualifications, duties, responsibilities or compensation. Accordingly, these documents are exempted from the Public Records Act by the express provisions of Section 364.183, Florida Statutes.

FPSC DOCKET 910163-TL

FPSC STAFF'S 16th REQUEST FOR DOCUMENTS

ITEM NO. 1

The following information identified by page and line numbers is considered confidential and proprietary:

<u>Page Nos.</u>	<u>Line Nos.</u>
001	4 8 9 10
002	3 4 5 6 7 8 9
003	3 4 5
004	3 4
005	3 4 5
006	3 4
007	3 4
008	3 4
009	3

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

010

3  
4  
5  
6  
7

011

3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13

012

3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8

013

3  
4  
5  
6  
7

014

3  
4

015

3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

016

3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11

017

3

018

3

019

3

020

3

021

3

022

3

023

3

024

3

025

3  
4

026

-

027

3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8

028

3  
4  
5  
6  
7

029

3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

030

3  
4  
5  
6  
7

031

3  
4

032

3

033

3  
4  
5  
6  
7

034

3  
7  
8  
9

035

3  
4  
5

036

3  
4

037

3

038

3  
4

039

3

040

3

041

3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9



Page Nos.

Line Nos.

042

3  
4  
5

043

3  
4

044

3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13

045

3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11

046

3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13

047

3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8

048

3  
4  
5  
6  
7

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

049

3  
4

050

4  
8  
9  
10

051

3  
4

052

3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8

053

3  
4  
5

054

3  
4

055

3  
4  
5

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

056

2  
5  
7  
9  
14  
17  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
26  
28

057

2  
5  
7  
9  
10  
11  
18

058

4  
6  
8  
10  
13  
16  
19  
22  
25  
27

059

1  
2  
3  
6  
7  
9  
12

060

15  
16  
18

061

-

062

15  
16  
18

063

-

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

064

15  
16  
18

065

16  
18

066

4  
7  
9  
12  
15  
18  
21  
24  
27

067

1  
3  
5

068

4  
7  
9  
12

069

17

070

2  
36  
37

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

071

4  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17

072

5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
11  
12  
13  
15  
17  
21  
22  
23  
28  
41

073

5  
20  
38

074

2  
3  
7  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
19  
20

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

075

4

076

2  
4  
11  
15  
21  
23

077

4  
13

078

2  
17

079

4  
7  
11

080

10  
14  
16

081

4  
35

082

10

083

4  
7  
11

084

10  
14  
16  
18

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

085

4  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35

086

9  
13  
15

087

5  
8

088

3  
4  
27

089

2

090

1  
2  
5  
18  
33  
48

091

4  
8  
9  
14  
18  
21  
26  
30  
37  
41  
42  
47

092

2  
6  
7  
11  
15  
21  
25  
31  
35  
36  
41  
45

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

093

2  
6  
13  
17  
22  
26  
30  
35  
39

094

2  
7  
9  
11  
15  
19  
23  
26  
29  
33  
37  
41  
45  
47

095

2  
6  
13  
17  
18  
23  
27  
29  
32  
36  
38  
40  
42  
46  
48



Page Nos.

Line Nos.

096

2  
6  
7  
12  
16  
24  
28  
32  
36  
40

097

4  
7  
9  
10

098

17  
21

099

3  
4  
5  
10  
16  
25  
27  
32  
35  
36

100

5  
9  
12  
14  
16  
19  
20  
22  
25  
26  
33  
34  
38

101

3  
4  
8  
9  
10  
12  
13

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

102

10  
11  
20  
22  
37

103

9  
10  
19  
21  
36

104

4  
8  
10

105

4  
8  
15

106

4

107

1  
11  
21

108

4  
7  
13  
18  
19  
20

109

5  
11  
12

110

16  
17  
19

111

-

112

4  
11

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

113

16  
17  
19  
34

114

-

115

5  
8

116

5  
8

117

16  
17  
19

118

-

119

1  
8  
15

120

13

121

5  
14  
23

122

2

123

2

124

4  
7  
16

125

5  
8  
13

126

3  
6

127

5  
8  
10

<u>Page Nos.</u>	<u>Line Nos.</u>
128	4 7
129	4 7 10 11
130	4 14 23 32
131	1 9 12 14 21 30
132	1 11 21 31
133	1 10 18 28
134	4 7 11
135	16 17 19 20
136	-
137	1 3 8 13 14 15 16 21
138	13 27 28 35

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

139

4  
7  
10

140

4  
7  
9  
10

141

1  
3

142

4  
7  
13

143

4  
7  
9

144

7  
16  
17  
19

145

-

146

1  
2  
4  
7  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
22  
25  
29

147

2  
3  
7  
10  
13  
16  
18  
32

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

148

7  
14  
15

149

4  
9  
10  
11  
12  
14  
16  
17  
18  
24  
27  
29  
30  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
41

150

2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
9  
13  
14  
19  
22  
23  
26  
27  
33  
34

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

151	2 6 8 13 24 25
152	2 3 4 5 6 8 13 18 19 20 21
153	6 7
154	4 7 14 15
155	1 3 4
156	4 8 9 11 13 20
157	3 12 13 14 15 17
158	6 12 13 15

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

159

1  
2  
7  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
18

160

5  
14  
17  
26  
30  
32  
33

161

1  
2  
4  
7  
11  
12  
13  
14  
16

162

2  
4  
5  
6  
7  
13  
14  
16  
18  
24  
25  
29  
31  
34

163

6  
12  
13



Page Nos.

Line Nos.

164

2  
3  
8  
13  
14  
15  
16  
19  
20  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
37  
38

165

2  
3  
4  
5  
17  
22  
25  
29  
32  
33  
35  
36  
40

166

6  
7

167

4  
7  
11  
15  
16

168

5  
6  
10

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

169

2  
3  
4  
10  
13  
16  
17  
19  
23  
26  
29  
30  
34  
37

170

2  
7  
14  
15  
21  
22

171

1  
2  
4  
8  
13  
14  
15

172

15  
22  
35  
37  
41

173

4  
12  
13

174

4  
7  
11  
15

175

1  
2

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

176

1  
6  
11  
12

177

25  
27  
30  
35  
36

178

1  
4  
9  
10

179

34

180

6  
7

181

4  
7  
11  
14

182

1  
2  
6  
11  
12  
13  
14  
17  
18  
20  
21

183

8  
9  
10  
12  
13  
14  
16  
20  
24  
27  
33  
34

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

184

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
7  
8  
9  
10

185

2  
6  
11  
12  
13  
16  
18  
19  
22  
23  
24  
28  
29  
33  
41

186

2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
11  
14  
32  
40

187

2  
5  
22  
23  
36

188

5  
8  
11

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

189

2  
3  
7  
12  
13  
14  
16  
17  
18  
20  
21  
22  
23  
29  
32  
37  
38  
39  
41

190

7  
9  
12  
17  
18  
24

191

1  
2  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
14  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22

192

5  
12  
13

193

4  
7  
10

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

194

2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
10  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
23  
25  
34  
35

195

5  
6  
8  
17  
19

196

9  
23  
24  
36  
41  
42  
43

197

2  
6  
15  
33

198

4  
7  
8

199

1  
2  
5  
9  
13  
15  
16  
17

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

200	2 16 17 24
201	3 6 10
202	1 2 3 4 5 9 13 17 18 19 20 21 22
203	8 22 36
204	14 31 39 43
205	4 5
206	6 7
207	4 7 10
208	1 2 8

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

209

2  
3  
4  
6  
7  
8  
15  
16  
19  
20  
24  
25  
32  
42  
44

210

13

211

2  
3  
5  
6  
10  
13  
17  
18  
19  
24  
28  
31  
39

212

7  
11  
12  
26  
29  
37  
38

213

5  
14  
23

214

2  
12

215

4  
7  
17

216

17  
19

217

4  
7  
14



Page Nos.

Line Nos.

218	16 17 19
219	4 7 8 9
220	3 22
221	4 7 11 12
222	4 7 10
223	16 17 19
224	4 8
225	5
226	5 8 10 13
227	3 4 5 7
228	2 10
229	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 10 12 15 16 18 20

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

230	-
231	17
232	-
233	-
234	-
235	13 15 17 18 20 25 26 31 33
236	28 29
237	-
238	-
239	31
240	3 37 38
241	5 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18
242	-
243	39 40

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

244

3  
4  
8  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
20  
21

245

28

246

14  
23  
24  
28  
32  
33  
34  
35

247

3  
8  
21  
27  
28  
32  
36  
37  
38

248

3  
4  
5  
26  
39

249

7  
28  
29

250

-

251

16

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

252	3 4 8 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 30
253	7 14 15
254	35 36
255	-
256	4 7 12 15
257	6 9 18
258	5 8 11
259	5 8 11 12 13
260	5 6 9 14
261	5 8 11 17

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

262	5 8 12
263	5 8 11
264	5 8 11 12
265	5 13 14 15
266	5 8 11 12
267	5 8 11
268	5 8 13
269	5 14
270	5 13 14
271	5 18 19
272	5 13
273	5 8
274	4 7
275	5
276	5 15

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

277	4 7 11
278	4 13
279	4 14 15
280	4 14
281	4 13 14
282	4 13 14
283	4 12
284	4
285	5 8 12 13
286	5 13
287	5 13 14 15
288	4 7 11
289	4 8
290	5 15

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

291	3
292	3 14
293	3 13
294	3 11
295	3 4
296	3 4
297	3 4 12
298	3
299	3 11 12
300	3
301	3 12 13 14 15
302	3 11
303	3
304	3
305	3
306	3
307	3
308	3 4 11

Page Nos.

Line Nos.

309	3
310	3
311	4
312	4
313	4 7
314	5 13
315	4 13 14
316	5 13
317	5 8 12
318	5 8 12
319	5 8 13
320	5 14
321	5 8 11
322	5 13
323	5 8 11 12