

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

BEFORE THE

FLORIDA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of
Investigation into the
integrity of SOUTHERN BELL
TELEPHONE AND TELEGRAPH
COMPANY'S repair service
activities and reports.

920260-TL
DOCKET NO. 910163-TL

DEPOSITION OF: DOROTHY RUTH HOWARTH

TAKEN AT THE INSTANCE OF: Florida Public Service
Commission

PLACE: 666 N.W. 79th Avenue
Room 640
Miami, Florida

TIME: Commenced at 8:35 a.m.
Concluded at 9:36 a.m.

DATE: Tuesday, April 20, 1993

REPORTED BY: SYDNEY C. SILVA, CSR, RPR
Official Commission
Reporter

DOCUMENT NUMBER-DATE
05997 JUN-38
1700-RECORDS/REG. CLK II

X-ref 5996-93

1 APPEARANCES:

2 HARRIS R. ANTHONY, c/o Marshall M. Criser,
3 III, 150 South Monroe Street, Suite 400, Tallahassee,
4 Florida 32301, Telephone No. (904) 222-1201, on behalf
5 of Southern Bell Telephone and Telegraph Company.

6 J. SUE RICHARDSON, Office of the Public
7 Counsel, Claude Pepper Building, Room 812, 111 West
8 Madison Street, Tallahassee, Florida 32399-1400,
9 Telephone No. (904) 488-9330, appearing on behalf of
10 the Citizens of the State of Florida.

11 JEAN R. WILSON, FPSC Division of Legal Services,
12 101 East Gaines Street, Tallahassee, Florida 32399-0863,
13 Telephone (904) 487-2740, on behalf of the Commission
14 Staff.

15 JANE W. MOSCOWITZ, Baker & Moscovitz, 3130
16 Southeast Financial Center, 200 South Biscayne Boulevard,
17 Miami, Florida 33131-5306, Telephone No. (305) 379-6700,
18 on behalf of the deponent, Ruth Howarth.

19

20 ALSO PRESENT:

21 STAN GREER, FPSC Division of Communications

22 CARL VINSON, FPSC Division of Research &
23 Regulatory Review

24 TERRILL BOOKER, FPSC Division of Communications

25 WALTER BAER, Office of Public Counsel

I N D E X

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Page No.

ERRATA SHEET	4
STIPULATION	5
AFFIDAVIT OF DEPONENT	57
CERTIFICATE OF OATH	58
CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER	59

WITNESS

RUTH HOWARTH

Examination by Ms. Richardson	6
Examination by Mr. Vinson	44
Examination by Mr. Anthony	54

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

S T I P U L A T I O N

IT IS STIPULATED that this deposition was taken pursuant to notice in accordance with the applicable Florida Rules of Civil Procedure; that objections, except as to the form of the question, are reserved until hearing in this cause; and that reading and signing was not waived.

IT IS ALSO STIPULATED that any off-the-record conversations are with the consent of the deponent.

DOROTHY RUTH HOWARTH

1
2 appeared as a witness and, after being first duly sworn
3 by the court reporter, testified as follows:

4 EXAMINATION

5 BY MS. RICHARDSON:

6 Q Would you please state your name and spell it
7 for the court reporter so we'll have it accurately.

8 A My name is Dorothy Ruth Howarth, H-O-W-A-R-T-H.

9 Q And your address, please?

10 A

11 Want a phone number?

12 Q Okay. And your phone number --

13 A My phone number?

14 Q Please.

15 A

16 MS. RICHARDSON: All right.

17 MR. ANTHONY: I'm sorry. Before we go any
18 further, Ms. Howarth, since Ms. Baker was here
19 yesterday -- but I don't know if she told you about the
20 stipulations we're operating under, which is: that the
21 deposition is taken pursuant to proper notice; we won't
22 go off the record without Ms. Howarth's consent; that
23 we won't waive reading and signing if the transcript is
24 actually written down; and last, we will reserve
25 objections except to the form of the question and

1 privilege, things like that, until the use of the
2 deposition. If those are agreeable with you?

3 WITNESS HOWARTH: That's fine.

4 MR. ANTHONY: Okay, thank you. I'm sorry.

5 Q (By Ms. Richardson) Okay. Ms. Howarth, have
6 you spoken to anyone other than the attorneys present
7 about your deposition here today?

8 A No.

9 Q Okay. Has anyone given you any assurance that
10 you would not be disciplined for what you say here today?

11 A Yes, my attorneys have assured me.

12 Q Okay. Are you aware that it's a criminal
13 penalty to lie in a formal deposition under oath?

14 A Absolutely.

15 Q Okay. Did you give a statement to a Company
16 investigator at any time?

17 A Yes.

18 Q Okay. Who was present in the room?

19 MR. ANTHONY: I'm going to object to all the
20 questions relating to any of the investigatory matters
21 on the basis of privilege and instruct Ms. Howarth not
22 to answer any of the questions relating to her
23 statement or the circumstances surrounding it.

24 MS. RICHARDSON: Okay. My one purpose was to
25 find out, on the basis of confidentiality, part of the

1 circumstances surrounding that as to who was actually
2 present at the time her statement was taken. And
3 that's as far as I will go at this point, other than
4 maybe a general question you can object to if I get
5 into the substance, just to get it on the record.

6 Would you still have a problem with my asking
7 her who was present in the room?

8 MR. ANTHONY: Who was present -- no, I don't
9 have any at this time. Who was present? I don't
10 believe I have an objection to. So you can answer that
11 question if you recall who was present. If you don't,
12 you don't.

13 WITNESS HOWARTH: I don't know his name, the
14 one who took the interview.

15 Q (By Ms. Richardson) Was that -- you mean
16 somebody from the Company?

17 A Yeah.

18 Q Okay. Was a union representative or anyone
19 else present with you?

20 A I believe there was an attorney. I remember
21 it, I think his name was Beatty or Bates. No one --

22 Q And it was just Mr. Beatty and you, no one
23 else?

24 A That's right. And this other gentleman, I
25 don't know. There were two.

1 Q Oh, there were two people --

2 A Yeah, but I don't know this guy's name. I
3 couldn't -- if my life depended on it, I could not --

4 Q Do you know his position? Do you remember if
5 he was --

6 A No, I do not.

7 Q Okay. All right. And then just, I guess, for
8 the record -- no, I'm not going to ask it now, I'll wait.

9 Okay, Ms. Howarth, we are, from the Public
10 Counsel and the Public Service Commission, are
11 investigating allegations of improper handling of
12 customer trouble reports within the Company. And
13 that's our purpose here today is to look into that. So
14 my questions are primarily going to be directed toward
15 that. And what I would like to start with is to find
16 out what your present position is within the Company
17 and how long you've had that?

18 A I am a maintenance administrator, and I have
19 been there since January 17th, 1983.

20 Q All right. In which are you still presently --

21 A I'm in the South Dade maintenance.

22 Q And have you been in South Dade since 1983?

23 A Yes.

24 Q And were you an MA all that time?

25 A Yes.

1 Q Okay. Who is your present supervisor?
2 A Maria Smoak, S-M-O-A-K.
3 Q Thank you for spelling it. Okay. Is she a
4 first level or second level?

5 A Yes, she is.

6 Q First level?

7 A First.

8 Q And who is her supervisor?

9 A April Ivy.

10 Q Okay. And who is the operations manager?

11 A Tad Rubin.

12 Q And the general manager?

13 A Linda Isenhour.

14 Q Okay. And how long has Ms. Smoak been your
15 manager?

16 A About a year.

17 Q All right. And who was your manager before
18 that?

19 A Prudence Taylor.

20 Q Okay. And about what years would you say Ms.
21 Taylor was your manager in South Dade? From about when
22 to when?

23 A Let me see. Maybe I reported to her about a
24 year.

25 Q Okay. So 1991?

1 A Probably. Every so often they, you know,
2 they revamp us.

3 Q Shuffle the deck, hum?

4 A Shuffle, right.

5 Q Okay. And before Ms. Taylor, who was your --

6 A Dottie Ketchum, K-E-T-C-H-U-M, I believe.

7 Q Thank you. So she would have been maybe
8 1989, '90 or --

9 A Right, that's it.

10 Q '89?

11 A Uh-huh. Ketchum was '89.

12 Q All right. And before Ms. Ketchum?

13 A Brenda Mitchell.

14 Q Okay. And do you know about what year Ms.
15 Mitchell was the manager there?

16 A Say '88.

17 Q Okay. Now let's look at second level managers
18 if we can, okay? Right now it's Ms. Ivy. About how long
19 has Ms. Ivy been your second level manager?

20 A About two years. I believe would be correct.

21 Q So 1991, about the same time as Ms. Taylor?

22 A Roughly, I would say that's right.

23 Q Okay.

24 A I think I reported to Prudence Taylor prior to
25 April coming there. Before that, it was Cherie Calvert.

1 Q Okay. Do you know who was before Cherie?

2 A Shirley Perring.

3 Q All right. And who was it before Ms.
4 Perring?

5 A Larry Rorrer.

6 Q And that's --

7 A R-O-R-R-E-R, I think.

8 Q Okay. I guess Calvert is C-A-L-V-E-R-T?

9 A Yes.

10 Q And Perring is P-E-R-R-I-N-G?

11 A I believe that's right.

12 Q Okay. All right. Ms. Howarth, are you
13 familiar with the terms "backing up the time"?

14 A Yes.

15 Q All right. How are you familiar with those
16 terms?

17 A Well, if a trouble -- if the guy calls in, he
18 said he cleared the trouble. And you look at it -- we
19 have two things, the out-of-service and the commitment,
20 you know, say, we're committed to repair this phone by
21 5:00 and we're striving to meet that commitment. And
22 within a reasonable time you could back it up.

23 Q Okay, when you say "you could back it up,"
24 what do you mean, "you could back it up?"

25 A The trouble report, the clearing time. We could

1 back it up, like a reasonable half hour or 45 minutes.

2 Q Okay. Who gave you instructions to back up the
3 time?

4 A I just -- I don't know who, exactly who, gave us
5 the instructions, you know. A lot of them, maybe the
6 person next to you. I didn't have no memo on it, but it
7 was just one of the things that you, you did.

8 Q Okay. You mean the person next to you being
9 another maintenance administrator?

10 A Right. We kind of worked together. You know,
11 one hears something, maybe I didn't hear it or maybe I
12 heard something she didn't hear or he didn't hear.

13 Q So it's your understanding that all the MAS
14 backed up the times on the clearing times?

15 A Yeah, we had --

16 MS. MOSCOWITZ: Objection, I don't think
17 that's what she said.

18 Q (By Ms. Richardson) Is it your understanding
19 that all the MAS would back up clearing times?

20 A I guess we all worked alike.

21 Q Okay. Do you recall when you were first
22 given this instruction, was it part of your initial
23 training to do this?

24 A I don't know, I don't remember. You know,
25 because we had three phases of this job, you know, you

1 dispatch, you did screening and you field assist. And
2 you were so busy -- I was so busy, I can only speak for
3 me -- learning the job, that I don't remember where all
4 these instructions came from or how they came.

5 Q Okay.

6 A But you are in a constant training in this
7 job because things, you know, the computers are in and
8 we worked from paper before.

9 Q Okay. Let me ask you, on the troubles that
10 you were backing up the times, would you do that on an
11 affecting-service trouble? (Pause)

12 A Okay. Define that a little closer.

13 Q Okay. What is your definition of an
14 out-of-service trouble? When is a trouble out-of-
15 service?

16 A When you can't be called or you can't call
17 out, that is out-of-service.

18 Q All right. Then in your definition then
19 that's out of service. What would be an affecting-
20 service, trouble that's not --

21 A Noisy, static.

22 Q Is an affecting service any trouble that is
23 not out-of-service, or is there a third classification
24 when you status something? Do you have just the two,
25 affecting service and out-of-service, or is there

1 something else the trouble could be?

2 A Physical.

3 Q Okay. That's a type code, right?

4 A Uh-huh.

5 Q Physical type problem. Let's go back and
6 clarify statusing. Do you deal with a trouble screen,
7 a call comes in to CRSAB, a customer calls in to the
8 CRSAB and says, "I have trouble on my line." The CRSAB
9 then sends you, on your screen, that particular
10 trouble; is that accurate?

11 A Uh-huh.

12 Q Okay. Are you then required to screen that
13 particular trouble?

14 A Yes.

15 Q All right. And then when you screen it, what
16 kind of decision-making goes on? What do you have to
17 decide about that trouble?

18 A What's wrong with it.

19 Q All right. And when you say "What's wrong
20 with it," is that like a type code, can't call out, no
21 dial tone, physical type problem?

22 A You have to either repair it or determine
23 where it should be repaired when you get that trouble.

24 Q Okay. Whether or not it's in the central
25 office, outside --

1 A Whether it's in the central office, or is it
2 outside, or is it something in the translation that I
3 could do. We have to screen the trouble, find out
4 what's wrong with it, why this customer can't call out,
5 why they can't call out. Do they have Touch-Tone, do
6 they need Touch-Tone? Is it reversed, or is this on
7 the right office equipment? There's oodles of things,
8 you're almost like an inside repair person.

9 Q Okay.

10 A You do a lot of things.

11 Q Okay. Now when it comes to you for
12 screening, all right, is that trouble already classified
13 as an out-of-service trouble or an affecting-service
14 trouble, or is that your decision to make?

15 A Well, some of them are and some of them
16 aren't. We have to make a decision of the ones that we
17 handle, whether it's out of service or whether it is
18 just service-affecting.

19 Q Okay. Now, when you make that decision, how
20 do you put down on the trouble screen that this is now
21 an out-of-service report? How do you indicate that on
22 that trouble screen?

23 A A certain code that would indicate it's out
24 of service.

25 Q And what kind of --

- 1 A An OOS is out of service.
- 2 Q OOS in the narrative?
- 3 A Uh-huh.
- 4 Q And then would you be talking about a result
5 code?
- 6 A Right.
- 7 Q Putting a 100 in the result code you'd
8 indicate out of service?
- 9 A Right.
- 10 Q Okay. And if you left it as a 900 result
11 code, that would be a service-affecting?
- 12 A Yes, ma'am.
- 13 Q Okay. So my understanding, and I want you to
14 tell me if I'm wrong, is that a trouble can be only one
15 of those two things. It can only be an out-of-service
16 result code or an affecting-service result code, is
17 that correct?
- 18 A I think so.
- 19 Q Okay, do you ever status anything other than
20 one of those two in terms of the result code?
- 21 A No.
- 22 Q And you've been doing this job since 1983 so
23 you would probably know if there was some other thing
24 you could do with it?
- 25 A That's right.

1 Q Okay. Now what I'd like to know, thinking
2 about that, we've got affecting service or service-
3 affecting and we have out-of-service.

4 A Uh-huh.

5 Q Okay. When you talk about backing up the
6 times and you've got service-affecting reports, do you
7 back up the times on service-affecting reports?

8 MS. MOSCOWITZ: Objection, you are asking in
9 present tense.

10 MS. RICHARDSON: Okay.

11 Q (By Ms. Richardson) Let's go back and talk
12 about prior to 1993 and prior to today. Prior to 1992,
13 just any time before 1992, when you were backing up the
14 times, would you back up the times on service-affecting
15 reports?

16 A Yes.

17 Q You would. Okay. Would you also back up the
18 times on out-of-service reports?

19 A Yes.

20 Q All right. Now, I want to clarify something
21 else with you. All right. You mentioned two different
22 times, you mentioned commitment times and you mentioned
23 clearing times. Are those the same time or are they
24 different?

25 A A commitment?

- 1 Q Uh-huh.
- 2 A And a clearing?
- 3 Q Uh-huh.
- 4 A Ask me that question again.
- 5 Q Okay, let's go through the report. You have
6 just received the report from the CRSAB and it is right
7 there on your screen and you're working it and you've
8 screened it. When you look at the report, it shows a
9 line record, has customer name and address at the top.
10 Okay. And at the top it has a COMM line with a date
11 and time, doesn't it?
- 12 A Uh-huh.
- 13 Q And maybe a can-be-reached number?
- 14 A Uh-huh.
- 15 Q All right. That COMM line, is that a
16 commitment line?
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 Q All right. What does that commitment line mean?
- 19 A That means that we, Southern Bell, I as my
20 job, is committed to try to get that trouble cleared
21 whatever the problem may be by that time.
- 22 Q Okay. Now are you familiar with the
23 Commission's regulation that requires out-of-service
24 reports to be cleared within 24 hours?
- 25 A Yes.

1 MS. MOSCOWITZ: Wait a second, I want to
2 object. Because you got -- that's a compound question.
3 She may be familiar with a rule that requires troubles
4 to be cleared within 24 hours. I don't think she knows
5 what's a PSC rule and what's a Company rule. And
6 you've stated that as though she would know that. I
7 mean --

8 MS. RICHARDSON: Let's make a distinction,
9 Ms. Moscovitz.

10 Q (By Ms. Richardson) Are you familiar that
11 the Company requires out-of-service reports to be
12 cleared within 24 hours?

13 A Now or years ago?

14 Q Let's say before 1992.

15 A Well, let's go back a little further.

16 Q Okay. How far back are you familiar that the
17 Company may have required this?

18 A Well, I don't know how many years ago it's been.

19 Q But it's been since the '80s, sometime in the
20 '80s?

21 A Yeah.

22 Q Mid '80s, maybe, '85, '86?

23 MR. ANTHONY: If you don't know, you don't know.

24 A I really don't. I really don't know what
25 year.

1 Q Okay. About how many years ago, then? About
2 how long ago? Four years, five years, six years?

3 A Well, I really can't even answer that
4 honestly. I don't know how many years ago. I would be
5 even afraid to say because I really don't know. If I
6 can't say positive, I don't want to say.

7 Q All right. Are you aware that the Public
8 Service Commission requires the Company to clear
9 out-of-service reports within 24 hours?

10 A Now?

11 MS. MOSCOWITZ: Currently?

12 Q Now.

13 A Now? Yes, I do.

14 Q And were you aware of this rule prior to 1992?

15 A You're back to that same question. I don't
16 know what year I knew this. I did not know it in the
17 beginning.

18 Q Not in 1983?

19 A No. I don't know. I can't answer that when
20 I learned of this particular situation.

21 Q Okay. Have you heard about it just within
22 the last year?

23 A No.

24 Q So it was before the last year, at least more
25 than 12 months ago?

1 A Oh, yeah. But I --

2 Q Okay.

3 A -- I cannot say when I was aware of this.

4 Q Okay. Now --

5 A Because I really don't know.

6 Q Okay. So we have a commitment time at the
7 top, and that's when the Company is committed to the
8 customer that they're going to have the trouble
9 cleared; is that correct?

10 A Uh-huh.

11 Q Okay. Now, we're going to move through the
12 trouble report. You've screened it, you may -- let's
13 say that you've already determined that it's out of
14 service, okay? And we're moving on down through the
15 report; and it's been dispatched out, the service
16 technician has gone out to work the problem. With me
17 so far?

18 A Uh-huh.

19 Q Okay. Please say yes or no for the court
20 reporter.

21 A Yes. I can't --

22 MS. MOSCOWITZ: Were you asking her if she
23 understands -- I mean, what is she agreeing with, that
24 she understands your question?

25 MS. RICHARDSON: That we're flowing through a

1 particular report here. I'm trying to get down to a
2 clearing line.

3 A Oh, okay.

4 Q (By Ms. Richardson) At the bottom and get a
5 definition, then, of a clearing line. What's a
6 clearing line on a report?

7 A That is the time that the trouble was cleared
8 on the line.

9 Q Okay. And when you say "cleared," do you
10 mean the service technician outside has called you and
11 said, "I fixed it"?

12 A Yeah, he's ready to close it. It has been
13 cleared. So that's a cleared line.

14 Q All right. And does the customer have
15 service at this point?

16 A At that time the customer -- yeah, that's
17 correct, the customer has service. The trouble was
18 cleared. So if it was cleared, the customer has
19 service.

20 Q All right. So we have -- my understanding is
21 I have two different times I'm working with, then: I
22 have a commitment time that the Company says we're
23 going to fix it by, and then we have an actual time
24 when the service was restored; is that correct? Two
25 different times?

1 MS. MOSCOWITZ: Objection. Maybe?

2 A Yeah, "maybe" is right. You're mixing a
3 commitment -- okay. Say you were committed to be here,
4 what, at 7:30 this morning?

5 Q Uh-huh.

6 A Okay. That is a commitment, you were
7 committed to do this by this time. Now the cleared
8 time is the actual time the customer was put back in
9 service. You also have a close time, you are closing
10 the report, which is a final status.

11 Q So we have three different times that we're
12 talking about, is that it?

13 A Well, you've got the screening time here.
14 Okay, then you got the clearing time, whether it was a
15 technician outside or whether it was me.

16 Q All right.

17 A When I cleared that trouble myself, I put
18 that time right there. And then I close it, when
19 everything is done. Does that answer what your
20 question was?

21 Q It does for me, but let me try it one more
22 time, Ms. Moscovitz.

23 Are there three different times that we're
24 talking about, three distinct times, the commitment
25 time, the clearing time and a closing time?

1 A The closing time doesn't matter. When you
2 close that trouble report it doesn't matter. You have
3 cleared the trouble, it has no effect on you or anyone
4 on this FST line.

5 Q But if I look at a trouble record, will I see
6 three different times, commitment time, clearing time
7 and closing time, if I'm looking at the record itself?

8 A Now you've asked me something else I'm not
9 sure of. You'll see the closing time, yes. Yeah, I
10 think the commitment time is there.

11 Q Okay. Now let's get back to my original
12 question now, if I can. When you back up the time,
13 which one do you back up?

14 MS. MOSCOWITZ: Objection, present tense.

15 Q In the past, you spoke of backing up the
16 times. When you backed up the times, which of those
17 times did you back up?

18 A The clearing.

19 Q You backed up the clearing time? Okay. And you
20 said you backed it up for maybe 30 minutes, is that --

21 A Reasonable, yeah. Reasonable 30 minutes.
22 Reasonable, you know, 5, 10, 15, 20, 30, I would say
23 that would be reasonable.

24 Q Do you know why you would back it up 5, 10,
25 15, 30 minutes?

1 A No.

2 Q It was just done?

3 A Well, if you were closing out a report -- if
4 the guy called in, say, at 4:30, he said, "I cleared this
5 at 3:30," you're going to back it up. You're not going to
6 close it out at 4:30 when he's calling, you're going to
7 back it up until I cleared -- his clearing time.

8 I mean, it doesn't matter whether that would
9 be a service-affecting or an out-of-service, he would
10 say, "I cleared this trouble at 3:30." So you're
11 going to back up that time, even though it may be 5:00,
12 to the clearing time. He said he cleared it at 3:30.

13 Q Okay. Did you ever question a service
14 technician when he called in about, "It's 4:30 now, did
15 you clear it before 4:30 or are you telling me that you
16 cleared it at 4:30?" Did you ever question him?

17 A Well, he's the technician. He should know what
18 time he cleared it. I'm only doing the computer work.

19 Q All right. Did you ever question him about
20 whether he actually cleared it at the time he was
21 calling you or if he had cleared it earlier?

22 A Oh, you always ask.

23 Q You always ask?

24 A Right, "What time was it cleared?"

25 Q Okay. And why do you always ask?

1 A Because you have to know.

2 Q Were you given instructions, did somebody
3 tell you?

4 A No, that's just the way it is. You have to
5 know. How would I know what time he cleared it? I'm
6 inside, he's outside.

7 Q But he wouldn't know just to volunteer that,
8 "I cleared it"?

9 A No, he would tell me. If he told me, I
10 wouldn't have to ask.

11 Q Okay. Let's say he told you it was 4:30. He
12 calls in at 4:30 and says, "I finished, you know, I'm
13 through." Would you ask him then, "Are you sure you
14 finished at 4:30, because our commitment time was -- "

15 A No, I never asked him, "Are you sure," never.

16 Q Okay. Let's say your commitment time had
17 been 3:30 and he's calling at 4:30 --

18 MS. MOSCOWITZ: But wait a second.

19 MS. RICHARDSON: I've got a hypothetical.

20 MS. MOSCOWITZ: Not only do you have a
21 hypothetical, but you're asking compound and leading
22 questions. And the part that she disputed was -- that
23 she didn't answer was that she never said to him, "Are
24 you sure?" She didn't question or challenge him, not
25 that she never asked him. That's the problem with

1 asking a compound question.

2 And my problem for not objecting to it at the
3 time it was asked. But she gave you half your answer
4 because you asked her two questions.

5 MS. RICHARDSON: All right. (Pause)

6 Q (By Ms. Richardson) On the troubles where
7 you were responsible for clearing them -- not an
8 outside service technician, okay? -- you indicated,
9 did you not, that some troubles you cleared yourself,
10 is that correct? Yes or no.

11 A Yes, I cleared trouble.

12 MR. ANTHONY: Well, I'm going to object to
13 the question. What do you mean by "clearing"? If I
14 understand it, Ms. Howarth was a maintenance
15 administrator. She wasn't out in the field clearing
16 anything. If you're saying --

17 MS. RICHARDSON: Well, that's --

18 MR. ANTHONY: -- so I object to the question.

19 Q (By Ms. Richardson) Okay, well then, let me
20 ask you: Under what circumstances would you clear a
21 trouble?

22 MS. MOSCOWITZ: Objection, foundation.

23 MR. ANTHONY: I'm going to object to that again.

24 Q (By Ms. Richardson) Well, let me go back
25 then. Did you tell me just a little bit earlier that

1 you actually cleared some trouble yourself?

2 A Well, I have to handle -- when I say myself,
3 within -- let me see if I could give you a --

4 Q I think you mentioned translations?

5 A Yeah. Well, that's handled by the
6 translation people, they would clear it and close it.

7 Q What about test-OKs?

8 A Yeah, I would close a test-OK.

9 Q Okay. And that would be just your
10 responsibility to close a test-OK?

11 A Uh-huh.

12 Q And that's a yes?

13 A Yes.

14 Q Okay. Would you have to, on a test-OK, for
15 instance, would you have to call another office to get
16 permission to clear?

17 A No.

18 Q Would you have to dispatch a test-OK?

19 A No.

20 Q Okay. So you would be the only one really
21 handling a test-OK report, is that correct?

22 A Right.

23 Q All right. Now, on those kind of problems
24 that you cleared yourself, like a test-OK, --

25 MR. ANTHONY: Object, she testified she

1 closed it, not that she cleared it.

2 MS. MOSCOWITZ: Exactly.

3 Q (By Ms. Richardson) On those troubles that
4 you closed yourself, would you back up a clearing time?

5 A No.

6 Q What time would you enter on those that you
7 closed yourself?

8 A The computer sets it.

9 Q Do you just hit a send key on that then?

10 A When I was ready to close the report, I would
11 hit the send key, yeah.

12 Q And then the computer automatically put in --

13 A Automatically what?

14 Q Automatically put in the time and the date?

15 A Yeah.

16 Q All right. And that was the current time and
17 date?

18 A Uh-huh.

19 Q Okay. Do you know of anyone who ever gave
20 you a clearing time for a trouble report that was not
21 an accurate clearing time?

22 MS. MOSCOWITZ: Objection, compound. You can
23 answer it, if you can.

24 A Ask me that question again.

25 Q (By Ms. Richardson) Okay. Do you know of

1 anyone who gave you an inaccurate clearing time?

2 A I have no way of knowing whether it's
3 inaccurate. Again, he is the one that cleared it.
4 They have to know what time they cleared it, I don't.
5 I'm not out in the field with them. I have no reason
6 to say whether he did or he didn't give me an
7 inaccurate, because he's responsible for his job the
8 same as I am.

9 Q Okay.

10 MS. MOSCOWITZ: We're being visited by a
11 small roach here.

12 MS. RICHARDSON: Oh, wonderful.

13 MS. MOSCOWITZ: Yes, it adds to the ambiance.

14 (Discussion of the record.)

15 WITNESS HOWARTH: Well, can I say something
16 just --

17 MS. RICHARDSON: Yes, ma'am. Do you want it
18 on the record?

19 WITNESS HOWARTH: I have been threatened by
20 the PSC since the hurricane, consistent. You know, you
21 don't get -- you know, the customers, "You don't do
22 this, you do this, this. "Because I have been handling
23 all the, you know, the irate customers; and they've
24 threatened me with the media, Channel 10, PSC,
25 everything you can think of, they have threatened me.

1 Q (By Ms. Richardson) And it's made your job
2 very difficult?

3 A Well, it's a challenge, and I like a
4 challenge. Some of them you can handle; some of them,
5 you know, are just plain unreasonable. But most of
6 them I have made a lot of friends, I have turned it
7 around. When they found out that I'm really going to
8 help them.

9 I'm sorry.

10 Q That's okay. Give you an opportunity to air
11 what you feel needs to be said, that's fine.

12 I want to move on to something else, I guess,
13 for a moment. I believe I'm not quite through with
14 that area of backing up times, but I want to give
15 myself a minute to think about it.

16 Let's go back to statusing out-of-service
17 reports. Has anyone ever indicated to you that you
18 should not status reports out-of-service today?

19 A Yes.

20 Q All right. Can you tell me who?

21 A No.

22 Q Was it a manager?

23 A Well, I'm assuming it had to be a manager it
24 came from, because we weren't making those kind of
25 decisions. But I don't know, I didn't see a memo; I

1 wasn't point blank told this, but it was just like a
2 general thing, you know, "Don't status out-of-service
3 in the Keys."

4 Q All right. And would it be days when there
5 would be a lot of trouble reports, like heavy rain
6 days, for instance?

7 A No.

8 Q It would just be -- how often would this happen?

9 A Maybe like over a weekend. You see, those
10 offices are small and they have indexes and objections
11 to meet, and that's what I took it as the reason we
12 weren't going to status them out-of-service.

13 Q So that they can meet their indexes?

14 A Yeah.

15 Q Okay. Do you know if the other MAs also
16 followed that, you and everyone else, then, would not
17 status out-of-service is my question?

18 MS. MOSCOWITZ: Objection.

19 A Yeah. Well, see, I'm only here for me, not
20 everybody else.

21 Q So you're unaware of what other people did?

22 A Yeah. Well, it's not my business to keep up
23 with other people is what I'm saying, I'm only
24 responsible for myself.

25 Q All right. In your opinion and in your

1 experience as a maintenance administrator since 1983, have
2 you ever been given instructions that you felt were
3 improper in statusing out-of-service trouble reports?

4 A No.

5 Q Okay. Prior to 1992, when would be the
6 proper time to status an out-of-service trouble report?

7 MS. MOSCOWITZ: Objection, compound.

8 A Ask me again.

9 Q I want to go before 1992, okay? Are you with
10 me on that point? All right. When were you instructed
11 -- at what point in the trouble reporting that you
12 worked on the trouble report, the statusing and
13 everything, at what point in there were you instructed
14 to status out of service if you determined that it was
15 out of service?

16 A Well, up front, you know, on the first line
17 of status, you was to determine -- there was some time
18 appeared way, way back that it was stroked at the end
19 of the trouble. But that's so far back that I didn't
20 even remember it.

21 Q Four years, five years back --

22 MS. MOSCOWITZ: Objection. Go ahead.

23 A Way back. I don't know, it's longer than
24 that, I would say.

25 Q Do you know which manager you were working

1 for at that time?

2 A No.

3 Q Okay. Do you know the purpose of statusing
4 out-of-service at the end of the report instead of at
5 the beginning?

6 A Well, the way I saw it at the time, because I
7 was new, I was learning, it was you could determine by
8 what was found that it was out-of-service better at the
9 end than you could at the beginning.

10 Q Okay. Do you know if the statusing at the
11 end was done in order to keep out-of-service reports
12 from going over 24 hours?

13 A I do not know that.

14 Q Have you heard the terms "building the base"?

15 A Yes.

16 Q And what does that mean to you?

17 A Way back, way back, okay? We used to stroke
18 -- like I said -- out-of-service even though it was not
19 out of service to build the base to meet these
20 objections, indexes. Because it didn't take anything
21 away from the customer, it was building the base where
22 we missed we'd still meet the objections or the
23 indexes. So if you -- I want to use you, for instance.

24 Q Okay.

25 A You called and said your phone wasn't

1 working, you had no dial tone or you can't call out,
2 whatever the reason was. And it was testing okay. I
3 called you and you said "Ruth, my phone is fine." I
4 said, "Very good." I close it out to the code,
5 test-OK, stroke it out-of-service. Didn't take one
6 penny away from you. Didn't take nothing away from
7 you, but yet it was stroked out-of-service. I mean as
8 far -- it built to help the base.

9 Q All right.

10 A Do you understand what I'm saying?

11 Q I understand what you're saying. I do.

12 A It did not take anything away from a
13 customer.

14 Q When you say "taking away from a customer,"
15 then is it your understanding that if a report goes out
16 of service over 24 hours that the customers are due
17 some kind of refund or rebate?

18 MS. MOSCOWITZ: Currently?

19 Q (By Ms. Richardson) Is it your understanding
20 today?

21 A Yes.

22 Q Were you aware of that prior to today?

23 A Yes.

24 MS. MOSCOWITZ: Now wait. We now have two
25 time frames.

1 MS. RICHARDSON: They're separate questions.

2 MS. MOSCOWITZ: But now let's have the third
3 question. When did she become aware of that rule?

4 Because that's the one that's relevant.

5 MS. RICHARDSON: That's the question I was
6 just going to utter. I'm so glad you're on top of all
7 of this, because I tend to sometimes lose it.

8 Q (By Ms. Richardson) At what point in time
9 did you become aware?

10 A I don't know. I do not know. I can tell you
11 basically how I found out when the customer -- how the
12 customer gets a rebate, and that's about two years ago.
13 I did not know how they were rebated.

14 Q How are they rebated?

15 A Some kind of -- in the computer, some kind of
16 computer sales.

17 Q It's an automatic?

18 A Automatic, right, yeah.

19 Q Process? Okay. Are you familiar with the CON
20 or carried over no code, intermediate status code, CON?

21 A Yeah.

22 Q Do you know how it's used?

23 A How it was used?

24 Q How it was used.

25 A No, I don't remember what that meant. I used

1 to back in those days, but I do not remember. It was like
2 -- like you say, it was an intermediate status. It was
3 something to do with a customer asking for a special date,
4 like a jack, you say, "I'm going to be home such-and-such
5 a date," I think. You know, best I can remember.

6 Q All right. Do you know if it was used -- ever
7 used to stop the repair clock, that 24-hour repair clock?

8 A No.

9 Q All right. Do you know what a no-access code
10 is?

11 A Yes.

12 Q What's your understanding of a no access
13 code?

14 A That's when a repairman has gone to the
15 customer's premises, they are not available, they have
16 no access to anything to repair. They put it on this
17 code and it's under jeopardy.

18 Q Do you know if the no-access-code stops that
19 24-hour repair clock?

20 A I do not know.

21 Q Have you ever heard of anyone using a no-
22 access-code specifically to stop the repair clock?

23 A No way.

24 Q Have you ever heard of anyone using a no-
25 access-code when no dispatch was made?

1 A No.

2 Q All right. Do you know what exclude
3 disposition and cost codes are?

4 A You're mixing two things in.

5 Q Maybe I am. All right. What's a disposition
6 code?

7 A A "disposition" is the code that codes what
8 was wrong. The "cause" is what caused it, period, with
9 a narrative. "Exclude" means it doesn't have those
10 codes.

11 Q Okay. Let's take disposition and cause codes
12 first, then. Are there certain disposition and cause
13 codes that would take an out-of-service report out of that
14 24-hour count so the Company isn't counted as a miss?

15 A A disposition code? Not to my knowledge.

16 Q All right. Let's talk about the CPE 1200,
17 1300 codes, the inside wire codes. Are you familiar
18 with those?

19 A Yes.

20 Q All right. If the trouble is inside the
21 person's house, it's an inside jack problem, and is
22 that closed to a 1200 code, disposition code?

23 A Well, inside?

24 Q Uh-huh.

25 A Well, if it is the jack or the inside wiring,

1 I think there is a 12 code now for that.

2 Q Now, if it's a 1200 code and the problem is
3 inside the customer's house and the trouble has been out
4 of service more than 24 hours on the index, would that
5 count as a miss for the Company if it wasn't repaired?

6 A I have no idea.

7 Q Okay. Now let's go to excludes, okay? You
8 said that there was some way to exclude a report. Can
9 you tell me what conditions you would exclude a report?

10 MS. MOSCOWITZ: Objection, I don't think she
11 said that. You may be right.

12 Q (By Ms. Richardson) You said that excludes
13 were different from disposition and cause codes? All
14 right. When would you exclude a report?

15 A Okay. Let me give you an example. Say a
16 customer reported, "My Touch-Tone is not working."
17 And you go in and they don't have Touch-Tone. You go
18 in and they don't -- they're not even paying for
19 Touch-Tone. You would refer them to the business
20 office to obtain a service order for the Touch-Tone, so
21 you would exclude it, "Request assistance provided by
22 the business office, exclude." There is no code for
23 that. What would you -- there was nothing there, you
24 would exclude it.

25 Wrong number reported. They say, "Oh, I

1 didn't report it, that's not even my number. I have
2 nothing to do with that number." Wrong number
3 reported.

4 Q What happens to a report when it gets
5 excluded, do you know?

6 A No.

7 Q Okay. Have you ever seen an out-of-service
8 report -- let me rephrase this.

9 To your knowledge, has an out-of-service
10 report ever been excluded?

11 A No. Why would you exclude something like that?

12 Q Okay.

13 A That's not excludable.

14 Q Do you know of anyone who has ever excluded it?

15 A No.

16 Q Have you ever done that yourself?

17 A No.

18 Q Has anyone ever asked you to do that?

19 A Absolutely not.

20 Q Okay. Are you assigned by the Company -- is
21 every employee assigned an employee code number by the
22 Company?

23 A Yes.

24 Q Do you know if anyone who has ever used
25 someone else's employee code?

1 A I can't answer that, I don't know.

2 Q Have you yourself ever used --

3 A No, I have not.

4 Q Have you ever been directed to use --

5 A No.

6 Q -- someone else's employee code?

7 A No way. And Lord help them if they use mine.

8 Q Have you ever had a maintenance administrator

9 -- I mean a manager direct you personally to contact
10 the manager before closing out out-of-service reports?

11 A No.

12 Q Do you know of anyone who has taken
13 out-of-service reports that were about to go out-of-
14 service-over-24, closed it and then reopened a new
15 report in order to repair and complete the trouble?

16 A No.

17 Q Have you ever done that yourself?

18 A Absolutely not.

19 Q Has anyone ever directed you to do so?

20 A No.

21 Q Do you have any knowledge of anyone backing up
22 clearing times in order to meet an out-of-service index?

23 MS. MOSCOWITZ: I think this is asked and
24 answered. Didn't we do this?

25 MS. RICHARDSON: I think what we did was an

1 objection to my question prior to this because I wasn't
2 stating it clearly or making a compound question. And I
3 tried to take some time to rephrase it.

4 MS. MOSCOWITZ: We talked about backing up
5 clearing times.

6 MS. RICHARDSON: We talked about backing up
7 clearing times quite a bit.

8 MS. MOSCOWITZ: So I don't understand the
9 distinction.

10 MS. RICHARDSON: I'm trying to tie it
11 specifically, the purpose of it, to the index, to meet
12 the index. And I'm not sure I was successful in doing
13 that earlier so I tried to take some time to get the
14 question just exactly right before I asked it.

15 MS. MOSCOWITZ: All right. Now, I have to
16 make you repeat it then, I'm sorry.

17 A Well, I think --

18 MS. MOSCOWITZ: Wait. Let me hear the
19 question again, I'm sorry.

20 Q (By Ms. Richardson) Let me see if I can do
21 this again. Do you know of anyone who has backed up
22 clearing times specifically to meet an out-of-service
23 index?

24 A I'm going to have to say no, because I don't
25 know.

1 MS. RICHARDSON: Okay. Ms. Howarth, I want
2 to thank you for coming today, I hope it wasn't too bad
3 for you.

4 WITNESS HOWARTH: A little nerve-racking.

5 MS. RICHARDSON: Yeah. Well, you're not
6 quite through. I think I'm through with you unless
7 they jar my memory this morning. But the Commission
8 may have a couple of questions, Mr. Anthony may have
9 some, and your own attorney may want to do some
10 redirect type questions before we're through. But I do
11 appreciate your time.

12 WITNESS HOWARTH: All right. Thank you.

13 EXAMINATION

14 BY MR. VINSON:

15 Q Ms. Howard, at the time that you were
16 refraining from statusing out-of-service troubles as
17 out of service, you mentioned that that was a practice
18 that was going on at one time in one of the maintenance
19 service you worked in. Were the managers aware this
20 was occurring?

21 MS. MOSCOWITZ: Objection to what the
22 managers were aware of. How can she know that?

23 MR. VINSON: In your opinion, were the
24 managers aware?

25 MS. MOSCOWITZ: Objection to soliciting her

1 opinion. What's it worth to you?

2 MS. WILSON: I think she can answer the
3 questions. This is just a discovery deposition.

4 MS. MOSCOWITZ: For what it's worth.

5 WITNESS HOWARTH: You have to ask it again
6 because I'm not sure I understand what you're saying.

7 Q (By Mr. Vinson) At the time that the
8 maintenance administrators, including yourself, were
9 refraining from statusing out-of-service trouble
10 reports as out-of-service, in your opinion were the
11 managers aware of that practice?

12 A I'm sure.

13 Q You're sure they were aware?

14 A I'm sure they had to be.

15 Q Do you recall ever hearing a manager talk
16 about that practice?

17 A No.

18 Q Is that practice something that was just
19 going on at the time that you began working there?

20 MS. MOSCOWITZ: Objection. I have no idea
21 what you mean by that.

22 Q (By Mr. Vinson) Ms. Howarth, do you
23 understand the question?

24 A Ask me again.

25 Q Is that practice of refraining from statusing

1 an out-of-service trouble report as out-of-service a
2 practice that was going on at the time that you began
3 working there, already in progress being done?

4 A I don't know whether it was already in
5 progress. I don't know.

6 Q Do you recall it beginning or being started
7 as a practice after you already had been working in a
8 maintenance center?

9 A I don't know. I don't know what was there
10 before I went there. I was busy trying to learn the
11 job, trying to learn the codes. I don't know where it
12 came from or when it came. I don't know whether it was
13 there or not.

14 Q Okay. Let me go the other end of that. Do
15 you recall that practice being terminated, instructions
16 being given to terminate that practice?

17 A Yes.

18 Q Do you recall the time that that practice was
19 terminated?

20 A No. (Pause)

21 Q Let me give you -- I'll try to make a very
22 simple hypothetical situation and then ask you one
23 question about it.

24 Let's assume that a trouble report,
25 out-of-service trouble report, comes in at 5:00 p.m.

1 and so the 24-hour requirement would be to put that
2 customer back in service by 5:00 p.m. the next day.
3 And the service technician is dispatched out and he
4 clears the trouble at 5:30. He calls into the
5 maintenance center and you talk to him and he says, "I
6 cleared this trouble at 5:30 and restored the
7 customer's service." Would you record -- let me ask
8 what time would you record as the cleared time?

9 A You'd have to record it at 5:30, that's what
10 he said.

11 Q Okay. So there would not be a backing up of a
12 reasonable period of time, you mentioned 30 to 45 minutes?

13 A No, I wouldn't. In those times you had -- in
14 those back days, you had to check, you know, for the 24
15 hours.

16 Q I'm sorry, in those what days?

17 A In those days when this was -- because that
18 hasn't been done for a long time. I don't know what
19 years it was, but at that time you would have to check
20 to see. Within a reasonable period, within a half hour
21 or if that customer -- okay, you said 5:30. Well, a
22 reasonable hour would be five to 5:00. Five minutes
23 would take that 24 hours away, right?

24 Q I'm not sure I understand what time you're
25 talking about would be the reasonable hour.

1 A Well, I mean if we could back it up a
2 reasonable time. I understood this was in the practice
3 somewhere, but I don't know.

4 Q Okay. So would this 5:30 hypothetical
5 example, the reasonable time that you could back it up
6 to would have been what time?

7 A Five minutes to 5:00.

8 MR. ANTHONY: I'm going to object to the
9 question because I think you've changed the
10 hypothetical. If you would restate the question,
11 because I think we're going in two different
12 directions.

13 Under Mr. Vinson's hypothetical, he said that
14 the service technician called in and said that he
15 cleared the trouble at 5:30, so maybe if -- just to put
16 it back in the form of a hypothetical, if you re-ask
17 the question and then I'll see what we're getting into.

18 Q (By Mr. Vinson) The situation I'm trying to
19 pose is that the trouble had originally been called in
20 at 5:00 p.m., 24 hours later at 5:00 p.m. would be the
21 end of the 24-hour period?

22 A Right.

23 Q The service technician actually cleared the
24 trouble and restored service at 5:30 p.m., in other
25 words, 24-and-a-half hours later. And he calls you;

1 and I'd like to know what would be the reasonable
2 period of time -- in your words, "reasonable period of
3 time" -- that you could back up the trouble to.

4 A If you knew --

5 MS. MOSCOWITZ: Wait. I have to put in an
6 objection. I don't know whether she said she would do
7 that or not. Now you've really asked her a different
8 question. You didn't ask her what she would do, you
9 asked her what a reasonable period of time is.

10 MR. VINSON: Right. I originally asked her what
11 she would do? Now, I'm asking her since she --

12 WITNESS HOWARTH: And what did I say?

13 MS. MOSCOWITZ: She didn't say she would back
14 it up --

15 WITNESS HOWARTH: I said 5:30 p.m.

16 MS. MOSCOWITZ: -- and now you're saying what
17 would be the reasonable amount of time she would back
18 it up? So I guess the objection is, you're misstating
19 her testimony.

20 Q (By Mr. Vinson) All right. I'm not trying
21 to state her testimony. Let me say that I'm trying to
22 ask you about -- I'm trying to close in on what you
23 mean by the "reasonable period of time."

24 A Okay. Well, let's back up here.

25 MS. MOSCOWITZ: You're closing in on something

1 for which you laid a foundation that disputes it. That's
2 not -- she didn't say she did that in that instance.

3 MR. VINSON: Okay. Let me ask a different
4 question then.

5 Q (By Mr. Vinson) In this instance where he
6 clears the trouble at 5:30, would you back it up a
7 reasonable period of time?

8 A When?

9 Q In this instance where it has been cleared at
10 the 24-and-one-half-hour point.

11 A Now?

12 MR. ANTHONY: Your original hypothetical, he
13 told her --

14 MR. VINSON: It was 5:30.

15 MR. ANTHONY: 5:30 is what he --

16 WITNESS HOWARTH: And what did I say? 5:30.

17 MR. ANTHONY: Right.

18 WITNESS HOWARTH: And then you turned around
19 and you asked me about if I backed it up, what would be my
20 reasonable time? And I said five minutes to 5:00.

21 MS. MOSCOWITZ: But she already told you she
22 wouldn't back it up if he told her he cleared it at 5:30.

23 WITNESS HOWARTH: Right. See I answered
24 that, "Yeah, 5:30." And then you said, "Okay,
25 hypothetical, reasonable time."

1 Q (By Mr. Vinson) I understand now the
2 question I need to ask is when would you use this
3 reasonable period of time --

4 A You would not use it.

5 Q Okay. Was there a period a few years ago
6 when it would have been used?

7 A It was, yeah.

8 Q And could you --

9 MS. MOSCOWITZ: Wait a second. I still
10 think, you know, there are two different things that
11 you are confusing.

12 Now, Ruth, I could be wrong about this so you
13 listen to me.

14 It seems to me that you -- there are two
15 different situations and then there are two different
16 time periods. So if we're talking all about before
17 1992, if that's the correct time -- I thought the
18 practice stopped earlier than that, we've accepted your
19 before 1992 because it includes a lot of time. I
20 believe what Ruth is saying is that if the technician
21 told her what time he cleared it at, she would enter
22 that time, she wouldn't back it up. If he didn't tell
23 her a time, she might make a reasonable assumption
24 based on his call about when he did clear it.

25 That has nothing to do with before 1992 and

1 after 1992. That has to do with two different
2 instances, one in which she might back up time, and one
3 in which she would not.

4 MS. WILSON: She hasn't said anything here
5 that the service tech didn't give her a time.

6 MS. MOSCOWITZ: No. He's giving her an
7 example, and sometimes he says the service tech gave
8 her the time and sometimes he didn't, and I don't what
9 she's hearing.

10 MR. VINSON: Okay. In all the examples, I've
11 intended to --

12 MS. WILSON: Let's move this on, okay. You
13 go ahead and ask your question.

14 Q (By Mr. Vinson) In all of them, once again,
15 the service tech last told you 5:30. Let's make that
16 clear. Was there ever a time during which you would
17 back the time up a reasonable period, using your words,
18 "reasonable period."

19 MR. ANTHONY: It's been asked and answered.

20 MR. VINSON: I'm just not clear what the
21 answer was and I just want to make sure that we have an
22 answer.

23 Q (By Mr. Vinson) Was there a time when you
24 would have backed it up, even though he told you 5:30?

25 A Well, I can't really say even -- because

1 normally you would put in the time that they say.
2 Because like I said before, they know what time they
3 cleared it. They give you the time, if you're closing
4 the repairmanperson out. But there was -- way back in
5 time is what I'm trying to clarify -- that maybe you
6 would have within a reasonable time, if you knew, you
7 would back it up.

8 MS. WILSON: If you knew what?

9 A If you knew the out-of-service was over at
10 5:00, there was a time it was done. And I think I've
11 already stated that right over here.

12 Q So there was a time when you would --

13 A Right.

14 Q -- back it up to before the 24-hour point?

15 A Yeah

16 MR. VINSON: Thank you. Those are the only
17 questions I have.

18 WITNESS HOWARTH: Are we all clear now?

19 MS. WILSON: Trying to be.

20 MR. ANTHONY: I'm not clear, Ms. Howarth.
21 You all are finished?

22 MR. VINSON: Go ahead. I'm sorry.

23 MR. ANTHONY: I might as well get this on the
24 record because we've got all sorts of questions and
25 answers here.

EXAMINATION

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

BY MR. ANTHONY:

Q It's your testimony that if a service technician told you that he cleared it at a certain time you would still back the time up earlier than that?

A Way back.

Q Okay. And how far back is way back?

A Quite a ways back.

What's this, '93? Maybe, what, eight years, seven years?

Q That hasn't been done in the last seven or eight years, though?

A No.

Q You said that instructions were given to you, you said there is a practice of not statusing out service reports for a given period of time in the Keys; is that a correct paraphrase of your earlier testimony?

A Yes, that is.

Q And you said that you were given instructions to terminate that practice. Who gave you those instructions?

A I don't know, we just didn't do it no more. I don't know --

Q Did somebody in management tell you not to do

1 it?

2 A It had to come from somebody in authority to
3 tell you to -- either to do it or not to do it.

4 Q Did anybody in authority ever tell you to do it?

5 A To status them out-of-service?

6 Q Yes, ma'am, or not to status them

7 out-of-service.

8 A Yeah.

9 Q Who was that?

10 A Whoever was in charge at the time.

11 Q I thought earlier you said that you don't
12 know, it was just done, nobody ever told you to do it.
13 Did I misunderstand your earlier testimony?

14 A Well, maybe you misinterpreted it. Somebody
15 had to tell somebody.

16 Q But you don't know who that somebody was?

17 A No.

18 Q And nobody ever -- did anybody ever
19 specifically tell you?

20 A I don't know how to explain it to you how
21 that place works. You didn't always get a memo, maybe
22 they said, "Well, we're not statusing out-of-service in
23 the Keys." Like over a weekend.

24 MR. ANTHONY: Okay. I don't have any further
25 questions, thank you.

1 MS. MOSCOWITZ: I don't have any questions.

2 MR. ANTHONY: Thank you.

3 WITNESS HOWARTH: Thank you. Any more
4 questions?

5 MS. RICHARDSON: Well, I have a bunch, but I
6 think we're going to let you go.

7 WITNESS HOWARTH: You're going to feel sorry
8 for an old lady? (Laughter)

9 MS. RICHARDSON: I would -- if you would take
10 this in the proper manner, I'd say "Tough Cookie."
11 (Laughter)

12 WITNESS HOWARTH: Thank you.

13 (Thereupon, the deposition concluded at 9:36
14 a.m.)

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

AFFIDAVIT OF DEPONENT

This is to certify that I, DOROTHY RUTH HOWARTH,
have read the foregoing transcription of my testimony,
Page 6 through 56, given on April 20, 1993 in Docket
No. 910163-TL, and find the same to be true and
correct, with the exceptions, and/or corrections, if
any, as shown on the errata sheet attached hereto.

DOROTHY RUTH HOWARTH

Sworn to and subscribed before me this
_____ day of _____, 19____

NOTARY PUBLIC

State of _____

My Commission Expires:

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

F L O R I D A)
:
C O U N T Y O F L E O N)

CERTIFICATE OF OATH

I, the undersigned authority, certify that
DOROTHY RUTH HOWARTH personally appeared before me and
was duly sworn.

WITNESS my hand and official seal this 12th
day of May, 1993.



Sydney C. Silva

SYDNEY C. SILVA
Notary Public - State of Florida

1 STATE OF FLORIDA)
2 COUNTY OF LEON)

CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER

3
4 I, SIDNEY C. SILVA, Official Commission
Reporter and Registered Professional Reporter,
5 DO HEREBY CERTIFY that I was authorized to
and did stenographically report the foregoing
deposition of DOROTHY RUTH HOWARTH;

6 I FURTHER CERTIFY that this transcript,
7 consisting of 56 pages, constitutes a true record of
the testimony given by the witness.

8 I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am not a relative,
employee, attorney or counsel of any of the parties,
9 nor am I a relative or employee of any of the parties'
attorney or counsel connected with the action, nor am I
financially interested in the action.

10 DATED this 12th day of May, 1993.

11
12 Sydney C. Silva
13 SYDNEY C. SILVA, CSR, RPR
14 Official Commission Reporter
Bureau of Reporting
15 Telephone No. (904) 488-5981

16 STATE OF FLORIDA)
17 COUNTY OF LEON)

18
19 The foregoing certificate was acknowledged
before me this 12th day of May, 1993, by SYDNEY C.
SILVA, who is personally known to me.

20
21 Patricia A. Church
22 PATRICIA A. CHURCH
Notary Public - State of Florida

23
24
25
Notary Public - State of Florida
My Commission Expires May 20, 1995
Bonded Through Troy Halpin Insurance Inc.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

BEFORE THE

FLORIDA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

:
In the Matter of
:
Investigation into the
integrity of SOUTHERN BELL
TELEPHONE AND TELEGRAPH
COMPANY'S repair service
activities and reports.

DOCKET NO. 910163-TL

DEPOSITION OF:

DOROTHY RUTH HOWARTH

TAKEN AT THE INSTANCE OF:

Florida Public Service
Commission

PLACE:

666 N.W. 79th Avenue
Room 640
Miami, Florida

TIME:

Commenced at 8:35 a.m.
Concluded at 9:36 a.m.

DATE:

Tuesday, April 20, 1993

REPORTED BY:

SYDNEY C. SILVA, CSR, RPR
Official Commission
Reporter

FLORIDA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

AFFIDAVIT OF DEPONENT

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

This is to certify that I, DOROTHY RUTH HOWARTH,
have read the foregoing transcription of my testimony,
Page 6 through 56, given on April 20, 1993 in Docket
No. 910163-TL, and find the same to be true and
correct, with the exceptions, and/or corrections, if
any, as shown on the errata sheet attached hereto.

Dorothy Ruth Howarth
DOROTHY RUTH HOWARTH

Sworn to and subscribed before me this

14 day of June, 19 93

Seymour Schulemson
NOTARY PUBLIC

State of Florida

My Commission Expires:

OFFICIAL NOTARY SEAL
SEYMOUR SCHULEMSON
NOTARY PUBLIC STATE OF FLORIDA
COMMISSION NO. CC277200
MY COMMISSION EXP. MAY 2, 1997