Legal Department

NANCY B. WHITE General Attorney

Southern Bell Telephone and Telegraph Company 150 South Monroe Street Suite 400 Tallahassee, Florida 32301 (404) 529-5387

December 1, 1993

Mr. Steve C. Tribble Director, Division of Records and Reporting Florida Public Service Commission 101 East Gaines Street Tallahassee, Florida 32301

RE: Docket No. 920260-TL

Dear Mr. Tribble:

Enclosed are an original and fifteen copies of Southern Bell Telephone and Telegraph Company's Request for Confidential Classification and Motion for a Permanent Protective Order. Please file these documents in the above-captioned docket.

A copy of this letter is enclosed. Please mark it to indicate that the original was filed and return the copy to me. Copies have been served on the parties shown on the attached Certificate of Service.

Sincerely,

ancy BWhite Nancy B. White

Enclosures

cc: All Parties of Record A. M. Lombardo H. R. Anthony

R. D. Lackey

• • • RECEIVED & FILED . B. . . 9 UK (42 - 2015)

DOCUMENT NUMBER - DATE

12854 DEC-18

FPSC-RECORDS/REPORTING

BEFORE THE FLORIDA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In re: Comprehensive Review of the Revenue Requirements and Rate Stabilization Plan of Southern Bell Telephone and Telegraph Company

2

÷ ...

Docket No. 920260-TL

Filed: December 1, 1993

SOUTHERN BELL TELEPHONE AND TELEGRAPH COMPANY'S REQUEST FOR CONFIDENTIAL CLASSIFICATION AND MOTION FOR A PERMANENT PROTECTIVE ORDER

COMES NOW, BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc., d/b/a Southern Bell Telephone and Telegraph Company ("Southern Bell" or "Company"), pursuant to Rule 25-22.006, Florida Administrative Code, and Rules 1.280(c), Florida Rules of Civil Procedure, and files its Request for Confidential Classification and Motion for a Permanent Protective Order regarding portions of and exhibits attached to the testimony of Kimberly Dismukes, witness for the Office of Public Counsel ("Public Counsel") filed on November 8, 1993 in the above-captioned docket. In support of its Request and Motion, Southern Bell shows the following:

1. During the course of this proceeding, Public Counsel has conducted extensive discovery of Southern Bell. Documents have been delivered to Public Counsel in response to Public Counsel's requests for production of documents and interrogatories. Those documents were the subject of Motions for a Temporary Protective Order filed herein and consequently are currently treated by Public Counsel as confidential materials.

2. Public Counsel has used certain documents and information in this proceeding as part of the testimony and exhibits of Public Counsel's witness, Kimberly Dismukes. Therefore, Southern Bell herewith files its Request for DOCUMENT NUMBER-DATE

12854 DEC-IS

Confidential Classification and its Motion for Permanent Protective Order for the information contained in the testimony and exhibits of the witness for Public Counsel. Southern Bell has appended to this Request for Confidential Classification as Attachment "A" a listing of the location in the documents of the information designated by Southern Bell as confidential, together with a statement indicating why the material should be treated as confidential proprietary business information.

ŝ

3. Appended hereto in an envelope designated as Attachment "B" are two copies of the documents with the confidential information deleted. Appended hereto in an envelope designated as Attachment "C" is a copy of the documents with the proprietary information highlighted.

4. The information deemed to be confidential by Southern Bell and identified in Attachment "A" contains several categories of proprietary information, each of which will be discussed herein.

5. The first category of information sought to be protected reflects contractual and/or lease information negotiated by BellSouth Corporation with unregulated affiliated and/or nonaffiliated companies. Section 364.183(3)(d) provides that information concerning contractual data, "the disclosure of which would impair the efforts of the company or its affiliates to contract for goods or services on favorable terms" is classified as proprietary confidential business information which is exempt from Florida Statutes, 119.07.

- 2 -

6. The information contained therein concerns the leasing of office space in downtown Atlanta, as well as other areas, and the details of specific provisions of these leases. The commercial leasing arena is highly competitive and disclosure of this information would impair the Company's ability to obtain the best prices and the best terms.

The second category of information sought to be 7. protected concerns information relating to the practices and procedures used by Southern Bell's external auditors. This information is entitled to confidential classification on the basis that such auditing plans and procedures of external auditors constitute proprietary work product of such firm. These practices, procedures and audit strategies are internally developed by Southern Bell's external auditors, are unique to that firm and collectively represent the firm's audit program. Such information relates to the external auditor's competitive accounting practices and procedures employed to provide its services to clients. Consequently, this is information relating to such competitive interests, the disclosure of which would harm the external auditor's competitive business if publicly disclosed. This Commission has previously held that such audit strategy and work program information is entitled to confidential classification. Order No. 25297, issued November 5, 1991 in Docket No. 890190-TL; affirmed in Order No. PSC-92-0135-FOF-TL, issued March 31, 1992; and Order No. PSC-93-1062-CFO-TL, issued September 21, 1993.

- 3 -

8. The third category of information sought to be protected contains information relating to non-regulated services. This information is entitled to confidential classification on the basis that it is information relating to competitive interests, the disclosure of which would impair Southern Bell's competitive business. Section 364.183(3)(e) specifically includes this information as proprietary confidential business information. Southern Bell's non-regulated products and services are provided in competitive environments subject to all the normal influences and sensitivities of such markets. Thus, proprietary information pertaining to the Company's competitive non-regulated services, or the services and products of its non-regulated affiliate companies, should be classified as confidential in order to prevent Southern Bell's or its affiliates' competitors from obtaining a competitive advantage as a result of gaining insights from access to such information.

9. The final category of information sought to be protected includes payments to legal firms and/or consulting firms hired by the Company to represent the Company in lawsuits either brought by or against the Company. This information is considered by Southern Bell to be proprietary confidential business information under Section 364.183(3), Florida Statutes inasmuch as disclosure of the information would cause harm to the Company's business operations. Release of this information could disclose to Southern Bell's adversaries in these lawsuits, the

- 4 -

settlement or general value of the case to Southern Bell by showing how much Southern Bell was willing to spend to defend or pursue the lawsuit. This would give a decidedly unfair advantage to Southern Bell's opponents in these lawsuits.

10. In accordance with Rule 25-22.006, Florida Administrative Code, the information for which confidential treatment is sought is intended to be and is treated by the Company as private and has not been disclosed on a nonconfidential basis.

WHEREFORE, Southern Bell Telephone and Telegraph Company moves the Prehearing Officer to enter an Order declaring the information described above, and contained in the indicated portions of the attached exhibits, to be confidential proprietary business information and thus not subject to public disclosure.

Respectfully submitted this 1st day of December, 1993.

SOUTHERN BELL TELEPHONE AND TELEGRAPH COMPANY

HARRIS R. ANTHONY

c/o Marshall M. Criser, III Suite 400 150 South Monroe Street Tallahassee, Florida 32301 (305) 530-5555

R. DOUGLAS LACKEY

NANCY B. WHITE 4300 Southern Bell Center 675 West Peachtree Street, N.E. Atlanta, Georgia 30375 (404) 529-5387

- 5 -

ATTACHMENT A

Request for Confidential Classification Testimony of Kimberly Dismukes FPSC Docket 920260-TL

Page 1 of 2

A. Reasons Information is Proprietary

- This information reflects contractual and/or lease information negotiated by BSC with unregulated affiliated and/or nonaffiliated companies. Public disclosure of this information would impair the company's ability to contracts for goods and/or services on favorable terms. Pursuant to Section 364.183, Florida Statutes, such information is classified as proprietary, confidential business information which is exempt from the Open Records Act.
- 2. This information relates to the audit strategy, controls, work programs and methodologies of external auditors, Coopers & Lybrand, to perform their audits of BellSouth. These audit strategies, controls, work programs and methodologies are internally developed by Coopers & Lybrand and represent Coopers & Lybrand's audit program. Public release of this information would cause competitive harm to Coopers & Lybrand. Making this information public would provide these strategies, controls, work programs and methodologies to others "free of charge". PSC-93-1062-CFO-TL, issued September 21, 1993 held that Coopers & Lybrand's audit program is confidential.
- 3. This information relates to Southern Bell's unregulated products and services, the disclosure of which would impair the competitive business and/or unregulated operations of Southern Bell. This includes information relating to the revenues, expenses or investment in these unregulated products and services. This information could be used by competitors to harm Southern Bell in its marketing of its unregulated products and services. As such, this information is classified as confidential business information pursuant to Section 364.183, Florida Statutes, and is exempt from the Open Records Act.
- 4. Some of the information reveals the payments and/or settlements made to legal firms and/or consulting firms related to contested cases which would bring harm to Southern Bell if publicly released. This information is treated as Proprietary and Confidential Business information by Southern Bell. Pursuant to Section 364.183, Florida Statutes, such information is classified as proprietary, confidential business information which is exempt from the Open Records Act.

ATTACHMENT A

Request for Confidential Classification Testimony of Kimberly Dismukes FPSC Docket 920260-TL

Page 2 of 2

B. Location of Proprietary Information

<u>Page #</u>	Line/Column	Reason
66	5-13, 19-22	1
67	1,5,7,10,18	1
68	1, 14–16	1
73	5-8	1
78	12-16	1 2 3 3
86	16, 21, 22	3
87	1,11,12	3
Schedule 11		
1	9 All Amounts & Descriptions	4
5	16,33,47,64 - All amounts &	4
	& descriptions	
6	9-12, 26-33, 73,74 - All	4
	amounts & descriptions	
7	12,13,18 - All amounts &	4
	descriptions	_
8	29,30,39,49 - All amounts &	4
	descriptions	

ATTACHMENT "B"

.

Two copies of the document with the confidential information deleted.

ATTACHMENT "C"

One copy of the document with the material which is confidential and proprietary highlighted.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE Docket No. 920260-TL Docket No. 900960-TL Docket No. 910163-TL Docket No. 910727-TL

I HEREBY CERTIFY that a copy of the foregoing has been furnished by United States Mail this 1st day of December, 1993 to:

Robin Norton Division of Communications Florida Public Service Commission 101 East Gaines Street Tallahassee, FL 32399-0866 Tracy Hatch Division of Legal Services Florida Public Svc. Commission 101 East Gaines Street Tallahassee, FL 32399-0863 Joseph A. McGlothlin Vicki Gordon Kaufman McWhirter, Grandoff & Reeves 315 South Calhoun Street Suite 716 Tallahassee, FL 32301-1838 atty for FIXCA Kenneth A. Hoffman

Messer, Vickers, Caparello, Madsen, Lewis & Metz, PA Post Office Box 1876 Tallahassee, FL 32302 atty for FPTA

Michael W. Tye AT&T Communications of the Southern States, Inc. 106 East College Avenue Suite 1410 Tallahassee, Florida 32301

Dan B. Hendrickson Post Office Box 1201 Tallahassee, FL 32302 atty for FCAN Charles J. Beck Deputy Public Counsel Office of the Public Counsel 111 W. Madison Street Room 812 Tallahassee, FL 32399-1400

Michael J. Henry MCI Telecommunications Corp. 780 Johnson Ferry Road Suite 700 Atlanta, Georgia 30342

Richard D. Melson Hopping Boyd Green & Sams Post Office Box 6526 Tallahassee, Florida 32314 atty for MCI

Rick Wright Regulatory Analyst Division of Audit and Finance Florida Public Svc. Commission 101 East Gaines Street Tallahassee, FL 32399-0865

Laura L. Wilson, Esq. c/o Florida Cable Television Association, Inc. Post Office Box 10383 310 North Monroe Street Tallahassee, FL 32302 atty for FCTA

Chanthina R. Bryant Sprint Communications Co. Limited Partnership 3065 Cumberland Circle Atlanta, GA 30339 Benjamin H. Dickens, Jr.
Blooston, Mordkofsky, Jackson & Dickens
2120 L Street, N.W.
Washington, DC 20037 Atty for Fla Ad Hoc

-

C. Everett Boyd, Jr. Ervin, Varn, Jacobs, Odom & Ervin 305 South Gadsen Street Post Office Drawer 1170 Tallahassee, Florida 32302 atty for Sprint

Florida Pay Telephone Association, Inc. c/o Mr. Lance C. Norris President Suite 710, Barnett Bank Bldg. 315 South Calhoun Street Tallahassee, FL 32302

Monte Belote Florida Consumer Action Network 4100 W. Kennedy Blvd., #128 Tampa, FL 33609

Donald L. Bell, Esq. 104 East Third Avenue Tallahassee, FL 32303 Atty for AARP

Angela Green Division of Legal Services Florida Public Svc. Commission 101 East Gaines Street Tallahassee, FL 32399-0863 Gerald B. Curington Department of Legal Affairs Room 1603, The Capitol Tallahassee, FL 32399-1050

Mr. Douglas S. Metcalf Communications Consultants, Inc. 631 S. Orlando Ave., Suite 250 P. O. Box 1148 Winter Park, FL 32790-1148

Mr. Cecil O. Simpson, Jr. General Attorney Mr. Peter Q. Nyce, Jr. General Attorney Regulatory Law Office Office of the Judge Advocate General Department of the Army 901 North Stuart Street Arlington, VA 22203-1837

Mr. Michael Fannon Cellular One 2735 Capital Circle, NE Tallahassee, FL 32308

Floyd R. Self, Esq. Messer, Vickers, Caparello, Madsen, Lewis, Goldman & Metz Post Office Box 1876 Tallahassee, FL 32302-1876 Attys for McCaw Cellular

Stan Greer Division of Communications Florida Public Svc. Commission 101 East Gaines Street Tallahassee, FL 32399-0863

Nancy B. White, Ans