## RIGINAL



Tracy Hatch Senior Attorney Law and Government Affairs Southern Region

Suite 700 101 N. Monroe Street Tallahassee, FL 32301 850-425-6360

February 9, 2004

BY OVERNIGHT MAIL

Ms. Blanca Bayó, Director The Commission Clerk and Administrative Services Room 110, Easley Building Florida Public Service Commission 2540 Shumard Oak Blvd. Tallahassee, Florida 32399-0850

> Re: Docket No. 030852-TP

Dear Ms. Bayó:

Enclosed for filing are an original and fifteen copies of AT&T's Objections to Verizon's Second Request for Admissions, Second Set of Interrogatories, and Second Request for Production of Documents in the above referenced docket.

Please acknowledge receipt of this letter by stamping the extra copy of this letter "filed," and return to me at the time of filing.

Thank you for your assistance.

RECEIVED & FILED

BUREAU OF RECORDS

Tracy W. Hatch

Sincerely yours,

TWH/las

AUS CAF

CMP COM CTR

ECR

GCL OPC

MMS. SEC OTH

Enclosure

cc:

Parties of Record

DOCUMENT NUMBER-DATE

01854 FEB-93

FPSC-COMMISSION CLERK

# CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE DOCKET NO. 030852-TP

I HEREBY CERTIFY that a copy of the foregoing has been furnished via electronic mail or as indicated this 9<sup>th</sup> day of February, 2004 to the following parties of record:

|  | BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. *      |
|--|---|
| Adam Teitzman                          | Nancy B. White                            |
| Office of the General Counsel          | c/o Ms. Nancy H. Sims                     |
| Florida Public Service Commission      | 150 South Monroe Street, Suite 400        |
| 2540 Shumard Oak Boulevard             | Tallahassee, FL 32301-1556                |
|  | 1   |
| Tallahassee, FL 32399-0850             | Phone: (850) 224-7798                     |
| Email: ateitzma@psc.state.fl.us        | Fax: 222-8640                             |
|  | Email: <u>nancy.sims@bellsouth.com</u>    |
|  |   |
| Florida Cable Telecom. Assoc., Inc.    | MCI WorldCom Communications, Inc. *       |
| Michael A. Gross                       | Ms. Donna C. McNulty                      |
| 246 E. 6th Avenue, Suite 100           | 1203 Governors Square Blvd., Suite 201    |
| Tallahassee, FL 32303                  | Tallahassee, FL 32301-2960                |
| Phone: 850-681-1990                    | Phone: (850) 219-1008                     |
|  |   |
| Fax: 681-9676                          | Fax: 219-1018                             |
| Email: mgross@fcta.com                 | Email: donna.menulty@wcom.com             |
| Sprint – Florida*                      | KMC Telecom III, LLC *                    |
| Susan S. Masterton                     | Marva Brown Johnson, Esq.                 |
| 1313 Blairstone Road                   | 1755 North Brown Road                     |
| MC: FLTLHO0107                         | Lawrenceville, GA 30043-8119              |
| Tallahassee, FL 32301                  | Phone: (678) 985-6261                     |
| Phone: (850) 847-0244                  | Fax: (678) 985-6213                       |
| Fax: 878-0777                          |   |
|  | Email: marva.johnson@kmctelecom.com       |
| Email: susan.masterton@mail.sprint.com |   |
| Covad Communications Company*          | ITC^DeltaCom *                            |
| Charles E. Watkins                     | Nanette Edwards                           |
| 1230 Peachtree Street, NE              | 4092 South Memorial Parkway               |
| 19 <sup>th</sup> Floor                 | Huntsville, AL 35802                      |
| Atlanta, GA 30309                      | Phone: (256) 382-3856                     |
| Phone: (404) 942-3492                  |   |
| Email: gwatkins@covad.com              |   |
| McWhirter Reeves McGlothlin Davidson*  | Verizon Florida Inc. *                    |
| Kaufman & Arnold, PA                   | Mr. Richard Chapkis                       |
| Vicki Gordon Kaufman                   | 201 N. Franklin Street, MCFLTC0007        |
|  | 1   |
| 117 South Gadsden Street               | Tampa, FL 33601                           |
| Tallahassee, FL 32301                  | Phone: (813) 483-2606                     |
| Phone: (850) 222-2525                  | Fax: (813) 204-8870                       |
| Email: vkaufman@mac-law.com            | Email: <u>richard.chapkis@verizon.com</u> |
| Allegiance Telecom of Florida, Inc.    | Allegiance Telecom, Inc.                  |
| Charles V. Gerkin, Jr.                 | Terry Larkin                              |
| 9201 North Central Expressway          | 700 East Betterfield Road                 |
| Dallas, TX 75231                       | Lombard, IL 60148                         |
| Phone: (469) 259-4051                  | Phone: 630-522-6453                       |
| Fax: 770-234-5965                      | i e                                       |
|  | Email: terry.larkin@algx.com              |
| Email: charles.gerkin@algx.com         |   |
| EDM C                                  | Florida Competitive Carriers Assoc.       |
| FDN Communications                     | C/O McWhirter Law Firm                    |

| Matthew Feil/Scott Kassman                      | Joseph McGlothlin/Vicki Kaufman        |
|---|--|
|   | 117 S. Gadsden Street                  |
| 390 North Orange Avenue, Suite 2000             | 1                                      |
| Orlando, FL 32801-1640                          | Tallahassee, FL 32301                  |
| Phone: (407) 835-0460                           | Phone: (850) 222-2525                  |
| Fax: (407) 835-0309                             | Fax: (850) 222-5606                    |
| Email: mfeil@mail.fdn.com/skassman@mail.fdn.com | email: jmcglothlin@mac-                |
|   | law.com/vkaufman@mac-law.com           |
| MCI WorldCom Communications, Inc.(GA) *         | Messer Law Firm*                       |
| De O'Roark. Esq.                                | Floyd Self/Norman Horton               |
| Six Concourse Parkway, Suite 600                | P. O. Box 1876                         |
| Atlanta, GA 30328                               | Tallahassee, FL 32302-1876             |
| Email: de.oroark@wcom.com                       | Phone: (850) 222-0720                  |
|   | Fax: (850) 224-4359                    |
| Moyle, Flanigan, Katz, Raymond & Sheehan, P.A.  | NewSouth Communications Corp. *        |
| Jon C. Moyle. Jr.                               | Jake E. Jennings                       |
| The Perkins House                               | Two North Main Center                  |
| 118 North Gadsden Street                        | Greenville, SC 29601-2719              |
| Tallahassee, FL 32301                           | Phone: (864) 672-5877                  |
| Phone: (850) 681-3828                           | Fax: (864) 672-5313                    |
| Fax: 681-8788                                   | Email: jejennings@newsouth.com         |
| Email: jmoy.ejr@/moylelaw.com                   |  |
| Xspedius Communications                         | BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc.*    |
| Ms. Rabina: E. Carson                           | Douglas Lackey                         |
| 5555 Winghaven Blvd., Suite 300                 | 675 W. Peachtree Street, Suite 4300    |
| O'Fallon, MO 63366-3868                         | Atlanta, GA 30375                      |
| Phone: (301) 361-4220                           |  |
| Fax: (301) 361-4277                             |  |
| Email: rabir at.carson @xspedius.com            |  |
| Supra Telecommunications and Info. Systems      | Supra Telecommunications and Info.     |
| Jorge Cruz-Bustillo                             | Systems                                |
| 2620 S.W. 2 <sup>-h</sup> Avenue                | Jonathan Audu                          |
| Miami, FL 33133                                 | 1311 Executive Center Drive, Suite 220 |
| Phone: (305) 476-4252                           | Tallahassee, FL 32301-5027             |
| Fax: (305)                                      | Phone: (850) 402-0510                  |
| Email: Jorge.cruz-bustillo@stis.com             | Fax: (850) 402-0522                    |
| Email: Jorge.cruz-oustrito@strs.com             | Jonathan.audu@stis.com                 |
|   | <u> </u>                               |
| Nuvox Communications, Inc.                      | Miller Isar, Inc.                      |
| Bo Russell                                      | Andrew O. Isar                         |
| 301 North Main Street                           | 7901 Skansie Avenue, Ste. 240          |
| Greenville, SC 29601                            | Gig Harbor. WA 98335                   |
| Greenville, 30 27001                            | Oig Harbor, WA 70555                   |
|   |  |
|   | :                                      |
|   |  |
|   |  |
|   |  |

| Casey & Gentz, L.L.P. Bill Magness 919 Congress Avenue, Suite 1060 Austin, TX 78701 Phone: 512-225-0019 Fax: 512-480-9200        | Sprint (KS) Kenneth A. Schifman 6450 Sprint Parkway Mailstop: KSOPHN0212-2A303 Overland Park, KS 66251-6100 Phone: 913-315-9783 |
|--|---|
| Sprint (NC) H. Edward Phillips, III 14111 Capital Blvd. Mailstop: NCWKFR0313-3161 Wake Forest, NC 27587-5900 Phone: 919-554-7870 |   |

Tracy W. Hatch, Esq.

## BEFORE THE FLORIDA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In Re: Implementation of Requirements) Arising From Federal Communications ) Docket No.: 030852-TP Commission Triennial UNE Review: Location Specific-Review for DS1, DS3, ) And Dark Fiber Loops and Route-Specific Review for DS1, DS3, and Dark ) Fiber Transport

Filed February 9, 2004

AT&T COMMUNICATIONS OF THE SOUTHERN STATES, LLC'S OBJECTIONS TO VERIZON FLORIDA, INC.'S SECOND REQUEST FOR ADMISSIONS (No. 3), SECOND SET OF INTERROGATORIES (Nos. 25-27) AND SECOND REQUEST FOR PRODUCTION OF DOCUMENTS (Nos. 12)

AT&T Communications of the Southern States, LLC (hereinafter "AT&T"), pursuant to the Order Establishing Procedure, Order No. PSC-03-1054-PCO-TP, issued September 22, 2003, and Second Order on Procedure, Order No. PSC-03-1265-PCO-TP issued November 7, 2003 (hereinafter collectively "Procedural Orders"), by the Florida Public Service Commission (hereinafter "Commission"), Rule 28-106.206 of the Florida Administrative Code, and Rules 1.280, 1.340 and 1.350 of the Florida Rules of Civil Procedure, objects generally to Verizon Florida, Inc.'s (hereinafter "Verizon") Second Request for Admissions, Second Set of Interrogatories and Second Request for Production of Documents to AT&T Communications of the Southern States, LLC.

#### OVERVIEW

AT&T files these objections for purposes of complying with the seven (7) day requirement set forth in the Procedural Orders. These objections are preliminary in nature. Should additional grounds for objection be discovered as AT&T prepares its responses to any discovery, or at any time! MATE

01854 FES-9 8

prior to hearing, AT&T reserves the right to supplement, revise, and/or modify these objections.

#### GENERAL OBJECTIONS

AT&T makes the following general objections to the Request for Admissions, Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents which will be incorporated by reference into AT&T's specific responses when AT&T responds to the Request for Admissions, Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents.

#### 1. Definitions

- A. AT&T objects to the "Definitions" section of Verizon's Second Request for Admissions, Second Set of Interrogatories and Second Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that such terms are overly broad, unduly burdensome, irrelevant, oppressive and not reasonably calculated to lead to the discovery of admissible evidence pursuant to the *Procedural Orders*, Rule 28-106.206 of the Florida Administrative Code, and Rules 1.280, 1.340 and 1.350 of the Florida Rules of Civil Procedure. Furthermore, AT&T objects to the "Definitions" section to the extent that it utilizes terms that are subject to multiple interpretations, but are not properly defined or explained for purposes of these Request for Admissions, Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents.
- B. AT&T objects to the "Definitions" section of Verizon's Second Request for Admissions, Second Set of Interrogatories and Second Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the definitions operate to include the discovery of information protected by attorney/client privilege, the accountant/client privilege, the work product doctrine or any other applicable privilege.
- C. AT&T objects to the "Definitions" section of Verizon's Second Request for Admissions, Second Set of Interrogatories and Second Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the definitions operate to include the discovery of information and/or materials containing the mental impressions, conclusions, opinions or legal theories of any attorney or other representative of AT&T concerning the subject of the proceeding and prepared and developed in anticipation of litigation pursuant to Rule 1.280(b)(3) of the Florida Rules of Civil Procedure without the requisite showing from Verizon that it has substantial need of the requested information and materials in the preparation of the case and is unable without undue hardship to obtain the substantial equivalent of the materials by other means.
  - D. AT&T objects to the "Definitions" section of Verizon's Second

Request for Admissions, Second Set of Interrogatories and Second Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the definitions operate to impose discovery obligations on AT&T inconsistent with, or beyond the scope of, what is permitted under the *Procedural Orders* and other applicable Florida law.

- E. AT&T objects to the "Definitions" section of Verizon's Second Request for Admissions, Second Set of Interrogatories and Second Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the definitions operate to seek discovery of matters other than those subject to the jurisdiction of the Commission pursuant to the Federal Communications Commission's (hereinafter "FCC") Triennial Review Order, Florida Administrative Code and Florida Statutes.
- F. AT&T objects to the "Definitions" section of Verizon's Second Request for Admissions, Second Set of Interrogatories and Second Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the definitions operate to seek disclosure of information that is proprietary confidential information or a "trade secret" without the issuance of an appropriate Protective Order or Confidential Classification as outlined by the *Procedural Orders*, §364.183 of the Florida Statutes, §90.506 of the Florida Statutes and Rule 25-22.006.
- G. AT&T objects to the terms "your company," "person" and "persons" to the extent that the definitions include natural persons or entities which are not parties to this proceeding, not subject to the jurisdiction of the Commission, and not subject to the applicable discovery rules. Subject to the foregoing, and without waiving any objection, general or specific, unless otherwise ordered, responses will be provided on behalf of AT&T Communications of the Southern States, LLC, which is a certificated carrier authorized to provide regulated communications services in Florida and which is a party to this proceeding.

#### 2. Instructions

A. AT&T objects to the "Instructions" section of Verizon's Second Request for Admissions, Second Set of Interrogatories and Second Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the "instructions" operate to impose discovery obligations on AT&T inconsistent with, or beyond the scope of, what is permitted under the *Procedural Orders* and the applicable Florida Rules of Civil Procedure. Subject to the foregoing, and without waiving any objections, responses will be provided in accordance with the *Procedural Orders* and the applicable Florida Rules of Civil Procedure.

- B. AT&T objects to the "Instructions" section of Verizon's Second Request for Admissions, Second Set of Interrogatories and Second Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the "instructions" operate to seek disclosure of the mental impressions, conclusions, opinions, or legal theories of any attorney or other representative of AT&T concerning the subject of litigation without the requisite showing under Rule 1.280(b)(3) of the Florida Rules of Civil Procedure.
- AT&T objects to the "Instructions" section of Verizon's Second Request for Admissions, Second Set of Interrogatories and Second Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the "instructions" operate to seek disclosure of "all" information in AT&T's "possession, custody or control" and to the extent that said "instruction" requires AT&T to provide information or materials beyond its present knowledge, recollection or possession. With respect thereto, AT&T has employees located in many different locations in Florida and other states. In the course of conducting business on a nationwide basis, AT&T creates numerous documents that are not subject to either the Commission or FCC record retention requirements. These documents are kept in numerous locations and frequently are moved from location to location as employees change jobs or as business objectives change. Therefore, it is impossible for AT&T to affirm that every responsive document in existence has been provided in response to the Request for Production of Documents. Instead, where provided, AT&T's responses will provide all information obtained by AT&T after a reasonable and diligent search conducted in connection with the Request for Production of Documents. Such search will include only a review of those files that are reasonably expected to contain the requested information. To the extent that the instructions require more, AT&T objects on the grounds that compliance would be unduly burdensome, expensive, oppressive, or excessively time consuming to provide such responsive information.

### 3. <u>General Objections to Request for Admissions</u>, <u>Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents</u>

- A. AT&T objects to Verizon's Second Request for Admissions, Second Set of Interrogatories and Second Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the Request for Admissions, Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents are overly broad, unduly burdensome, irrelevant, oppressive and not reasonably calculated to lead to the discovery of admissible evidence pursuant to the *Procedural Orders*, Rule 28-106.206 of the Florida Administrative Code, and Rules 1.280, 1.340 and 1.350 of the Florida Rules of Civil Procedure.
- B. AT&T objects to Verizon's Second Request for Admissions, Second Set of Interrogatories and Second Request for Production of

Documents to AT&T to the extent that the Request for Admissions, Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents purport to seek discovery of information protected by attorney/client privilege, the accountant/client privilege, the work product document or any other applicable privilege.

- C. AT&T objects to Verizon's Second Request for Admissions, Second Set of Interrogatories and Second Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the Request for Admissions, Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents purport to seek discovery of information and/or materials containing the mental impressions, conclusions, opinions or legal theories of any attorney or other representative of AT&T concerning the subject of the proceeding and prepared and developed in anticipation of litigation pursuant to Rule 1.280(b)(3) of the Florida Rules of Civil Procedure without the requisite showing from Verizon that it has substantial need of the requested information and materials in the preparation of the case and in unable without undue hardship to obtain the substantial equivalent of the materials by other means.
- D. AT&T objects to Verizon's Second Request for Admissions, Second Set of Interrogatories and Second Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the Request for Admissions, Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents purport to impose discovery obligations on AT&T inconsistent with, or beyond the scope of, what is permitted under the *Procedural Orders* and the applicable Florida Rules of Civil Procedure.
- E. AT&T objects to Verizon's Second Request for Admissions, Second Set of Interrogatories and Second Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the Request for Admissions, Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents purport to seek discovery of matters other than those subject to the jurisdiction of the Commission pursuant to the FCC's Triennial Review Order, Florida Administrative Code and Florida Statutes.
- F. AT&T objects to Verizon's Second Request for Admissions, Second Set of Interrogatories and Second Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the Request for Admissions, Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents purport to seek disclosure of information that is proprietary confidential information or a "trade secret" without the issuance of an appropriate Protective Order or Confidential Classification as outlined by the *Procedural Orders*, §364.183 of the Florida Statutes, §90-506 of the Florida Statutes, and Rule 25-22.006.

- G. AT&T objects to all Requests for Admissions, Interrogatories and Production of Documents which require the disclosure of information which already is in the public domain or otherwise on record with the Commission or the FCC.
- H. AT&T objects to Verizon's Second Request for Admissions, Second Set of Interrogatories and Second Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the Request for Admissions, Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents seek information and discovery of facts known and opinions held by experts acquired and/or developed in anticipation of litigation or for hearing and outside the scope of discoverable information pursuant to Rule 1.280(4) of the Florida Rules of Civil Procedure.
- I. Pursuant to the *Procedural Orders*, the Triennial Review Order, Rule 28-106.206 of the Florida Administrative Code, and Rules 1.280, 1.340 and 1.350 of the Florida Rules of Civil Procedure, to the extent that Verizon's Request for Production of Documents request specific financial, business or proprietary information regarding AT&T's economic business model, AT&T objects to providing or producing any such information on the grounds that those Request for Admissions, Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents presume that the market entry analysis is contingent upon AT&T's economic business model instead of the hypothetical business model contemplated by the Triennial Review Order.

Respectfully submitted, this the 9th day of February 2004.

Tracy W. Hatch

AT&T

101 N. Monroe Street, Suite 700

Tallahassee, FL 32301

(850) 425-6360

Attorney for AT&T Communications of the Southern States, LLC