

Matilda Sanders

From: Daniels,Sonia C - LGCRP [soniadaniels@att.com]
 Sent: Wednesday, October 27, 2004 1:42 PM
 To: Filings@psc.state.fl.us
 Cc: Lisa Harvey; PCHRISTE@psc.state.fl.us; rmulvany@birch.com; gwatkins@covad.com; mfeil@mail.fdn.com; Michael Gross; dst@tobinreyes.com; aleiro@idstelcom.com; NEdwards@itcdeltacom.com; Donna McNulty; Jerry Hallenstein; jmclau@kmctelecom.com; jacanis@kelleydrye.com; mhazzard@kelleydrye.com; jmcglathlin@mac-law.com; Vicki Gordon Kaufman; rheatter@mpowercom.com; danyelle.kennedy@networktelephone.net; Inowalsky@nbglaw.com; Michael Britt; Peter Dunbar; Susan Masterton; Dulaney L. O'Roark; Mark.Ozanick@accesscomm.com; mconquest@itcdeltacom.com; MCampbell@nuvox.com; TSauder@birch.com; Nancy Sims; Nancy White; Tracy Hatch; Chris McDonald; Musselwhite,Brian J - LGCRP; Ross-Bain,Martha M - LGCRP; Norris,Sharon E - LGCRP; Daniels,Sonia C - LGCRP
 Subject: RE: 000121A -- CLEC Response to Action Items from 10-12 and 10-13 SEEM Workshop



000121
EEM Action II

Docket No. 000121A-TP -- In re: Investigation into the Establishment of Operations Support system Permanent Performance Measures for Incumbent Local Exchange Telecommunications Companies (BellSouth track)

Attached please find for electronic filing the CLEC Coalition's Response to Action Items from the October 12 and October 13, 2004 SEEM Workshop in the above-referenced docket. The cover letter, certificate of service and the CLEC Coalition's Reply are a total of 9 pages. The attached document should be considered the official version for purposes of the docket file.

As indicated in the cover letter, copies of the CLEC Coalition's Response are being distributed to parties via electronic (in cases where e-mail addresses are available) and U.S. Mail. Thank you for your assistance in this matter.

<<000121 CLEC SEEM Action Item Responses 10-27-04.pdf>>

Sonia Daniels
Docket Manager
AT&T Law & Gov't Affairs
1230 Peachtree
4th Floor
Atlanta, GA 30309
Phone: 404-810-8488
Fax: 281-664-9791

CMP _____
 COM _____
 CTR _____
 ECR _____
 GCL _____
 OPC _____
 MMS _____
 RCA _____
 SCR _____
 SEC 1
 OTH _____

>
 >
 >
 > << File: CLEC Non-Tech Matrix Resp 10-26.pdf >>
 >
 >
 >
 > Sonia Daniels
 > Docket Manager
 > AT&T Law & Gov't Affairs
 > 1230 Peachtree
 > 4th Floor

DOCUMENT NUMBER-DATE

11599 OCT 27 3

ORIGINAL



Tracy Hatch
Senior Attorney
Law and Government Affairs
Southern Region

Suite 700
101 N. Monroe Street
Tallahassee, FL 32301
850-425-6360

October 27, 2004

BY ELECTRONIC FILING

Ms. Blanca Bayó, Director
The Commission Clerk and Administrative Services
Room 110, Easley Building
Florida Public Service Commission
2540 Shumard Oak Blvd.
Tallahassee, Florida 32399-0850

Re: Docket No. 000121A-TP

Dear Ms. Bayó:

Attached please find the CLEC Coalition's Reply to Action Items from the October 12 and 13, 2004, SEEM workshop in the above-referenced docket. Pursuant to the Commission's Electronic Filing Requirements, this version should be considered the official copy for purposes of the docket file. Copies of this document will be served on all parties via electronic and U.S. Mail.

Thank you for your assistance with this filing.

Sincerely yours,

s/ Tracy W. Hatch

Tracy W. Hatch

TWH/las
Attachment
cc: Parties of Record

DOCUMENT NUMBER - DATE

11599 OCT 27 04

FPSC-COMMISSION CLERK

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that a true and correct copy of the CLEC's Response was served
by U.S. Mail this 27th day of October 2004 to the following:

(*) Blanca S. Bayo
Florida Public Service Commission
2540 Shumard Oak Boulevard
Tallahassee, FL 3239-0850

Ms. Nancy B. White
c/o Nancy H. Sims
BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc.
150 S. Monroe Street, Suite 400
Tallahassee, FL 32301-1556

Michael A. Gross
Florida Cable Telecommunications Assoc.
246 E. 6th Avenue, Suite 100
Tallahassee, FL 32302

Nanette Edwards
ITC Deltacom
4092 South Memorial Parkway
Huntsville, AL 35802

Donna Canzano McNulty
MCI
1203 Governors Square Blvd., Suite 201
Tallahassee, FL 32301

John D. McLaughlin, Jr.
KMC Telecom, Inc.
1755 North Brown Road
Lawrenceville, GA 30043

Messer Law Firm
Floyd Self
Norman Horton
P.O. Box 1867
Tallahassee, FL 32302

Pennington Law Firm
Peter Dunbar
Karen Camechis

P.O. Box 10095
Tallahassee, FL 32302-2095

Rutledge Law Firm
Kenneth Hoffman
John Ellis
P.O. Box 551
Tallahassee, FL 32302-0551

McWhirter Law Firm
Joseph McGlothlin/Vicki Kaufman
117 S. Gadsden St.
Tallahassee, FL 32301

Wayne Stavanja/Mark Buechele
Supra Telecom
1311 Executive Center Drive, Suite 200
Tallahassee, FL 32301

Kimberly Caswell
Verizon Select Services, Inc.
P.O. Box 110, FLTC0007
Tampa, FL 33601-0110

John Rubino
George S. Ford
Z-Tel Communications, Inc.
601 S. Harbour Island Blvd.
Tampa, FL 33602-5706

Renee Terry
e.spire Communications, Inc.
131 National Business Parkway, #100
Annapolis Junction, MD 20701-10001

William Weber
Covad Communications Company
19th Floor, Promenade II
1230 Peachtree Street, NE
Atlanta, GA 30309-3574

WorldCom, Inc.
Dulaney O’Roark, III
Six Concourse Parkway, Suite 3200
Atlanta, GA 30328

IDS Telecom, LLC
Angel Leiro/Joe Millstone
1525 N.W. 167th Street, Second Floor
Miami, FL 33169-5131

Katz, Kutter Law Firm
Charles Pellegrini/Patrick Wiggins
106 East College Avenue, 12th Floor
Tallahassee, FL 32301

Mpower Communications Corp.
David Woodsmall
175 Sully's Trail, Suite 300
Pittsford, NY 14534-4558

ALLTEL Communications, Inc.
C/O Ausley Law Firm
Jeffrey Whalen
PO BOX 391
Tallahassee, FL 32302

BellSouth Telecom., Inc.
Patrick W. Turner/R. Douglas Lackey
675 W. Peachtree Street, Suite 4300
Atlanta, GA 30375

Sprint Communications Company
Susan Masterton/Charles Rehwinkel
PO BOX 2214
MS: FLTLHO0107
Tallahassee, FL 32316-2214

Miller Isar, Inc,
Andrew O. Isar
7901 Skansie Ave., Suite 240
Gig Harbor, WA 98335-8349

Birch Telecom of the South, Inc.
Tad J. Sauder
Manager, ILEC Performance Data
2020 Baltimore Ave.
Kansas City, MO 64108

Suzanne F. Summerlin
2536 Capital Medical Blvd.
Tallahassee, FL 32308-4424

Kelley Drye & Warren, LLP
Jonathan E. Canis/Michael B. Hazzard
1200 19th Street, N.W., 5th Floor
Washington, DC 20036

David Benck
Momentum Business Solutions, Inc.
2700 Corporate Drive
Suite 200
Birmingham, AL 35242

Russell E. Hamilton, III
Nuvox Communications, Inc.
301 N. Main Street, Suite 5000
Greenville, SC 29601

s/ Tracy W. Hatch
Tracy W. Hatch

BEFORE THE FLORIDA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In re: Investigation into the Establishment)	
of Operations Support System Permanent)	Docket No. 000121A-TP
Performance Measures for Incumbent)	
Local Exchange Telecommunications)	Filed: October 27 2004
Companies (BellSouth Track))	

CLEC COALITION REPLY TO ACTION ITEMS

Competitive Local Exchange Carriers (“CLECs”), AT&T Communications of the Southern States, LLC; Birch Telecom; DIECA Communications Company d/b/a Covad Communications Company (“Covad”); ITC^DeltaCom Communications, Inc. (“ITC^DeltaCom/BTI”); MCImetro Access Transmission Services, LLC, MCI WorldCom Communications, Inc.; and Network Telephone Corp., hereinafter collectively referred to as the “CLEC Coalition,” hereby file the following responses to the Florida Public Service Commission Staff’s (“Staff’s”) request that answers be supplied for the following Action Items from the October 12 and 13, 2004 SEEM workshop:

1. CLECs will provide data and an explanation to show how the B values were derived.

Tables A.2 and A.3 of the CLEC Comments filed August 18, 2004 show “B” values needed to compute remedy amounts for benchmark and parity measures, respectively, under the CLEC proposed changes to the SEEM plan. These values were determined from analysis of the historical data available to CLECs on Tier I violations.

Values were designed to achieve rough comparability, for the historic data, between the CLEC proposed remedy amounts and the current fixed remedy amounts. Rather than attempt to achieve an unrealistic level of precision, the tables were simplified by specifying a handful of round values for *B*.

Table 1 compares average remedy amounts under the CLEC proposal with the current fixed remedy amount of \$450 for benchmark measures. The table summarizes calculations for all Tier I benchmark violations for the period March to May 2003.

Table 2 shows similar comparisons for parity measures, for a one year period, May 2002 to April 2003. Results are broken down by product group, since *B* values and current remedy amounts differ by product group. Because the CLECs do not have access to cell level data, which is required for calculation of the disparity index proposed by the CLECs for parity measures, the results in the Table 2 are based on use of the “old” disparity index supplied with the parity data.

Table 1
Comparison of Current Fixed Remedy Amounts with Amounts under the CLEC Proposal for Benchmark Violations between March and May 2003, by Measure

Measure	Remedy	Median	Mean
AKC	450	693	982
ATE	450	322	322
FOCRC	450	296	400
FOCT	450	476	867
PFTSR	450	470	874
RI	450	452	707

Table 2
Comparison of Current Fixed Remedy Amounts with Amounts under the CLEC Proposal for Parity Violations between May 2002 and April 2003, by Measure and Product Group

Measure	Product Group	Current Amount	CLEC Prop. Median	CLEC Prop. Mean
AOCCNI	LNP	1800	2277	2827
AOCCNI	PR	1200	598	1685
AOCCNI	PR-UNE	4750	4776	7513
CTRR	ICTRK	1200	960	1368
CTRR	MR	1200	1392	2284
CTRR	MR-UNE	4750	7999	9972
MAD	MR	1200	712	1260
MAD	MR-UNE	4750	2894	5213
OOS	MR	1200	1015	1424
OOS	MR-UNE	4750	3800	4883
PMIAIS	LNP	1800	1440	1628
PMIAIS	PR	1200	960	1752
PMIAIS	PR-UNE	4750	4743	7077
PMRA	MR	1200	960	1874
PMRA	MR-UNE	4750	3800	7191
PPT	PR	1200	1068	1785
PPT	PR-UNE	4750	4901	6666
PRT	MR	1200	1393	1779
PRT	MR-UNE	4750	4429	5449

2. CLECs will provide a list of issues/ideas that merit further discussion at the next workshop.

- Presentation of specific data to support the disaggregation proposed by BellSouth
- Impact of requiring two consecutive violations on error balancing
- Elimination of trimming in BellSouth proposal
- Clarification of BellSouth's proposed changes to Section C.2 (p. 76). Should "sum" be changed to "average" in the second to last sentence?
- Discussion of BellSouth's Response to Action Items dated October 20, 2004.
- Discussion of coefficients proposed by BellSouth in Row 43 of "non-technical matrix."

Respectfully submitted this 27th day of October, 2004.

CLEC COALITION

s/ Tracy Hatch

Tracy Hatch
AT&T Communications of the Southern States,
LLC
101 N. Monroe St., Suite 700
Tallahassee, FL 32301

s/ Rose Mulvany Henry

Rose Mulvany Henry
Vice President of Regulatory Affairs
Birch Telecom, Inc.
2020 Baltimore Avenue
Kansas City, MO 64108

s/ Gene Watkins

Charles E. (Gene) Watkins
Senior Counsel, DIECA Communications, Inc.
d/b/a Covad Communications Co.
1230 Peachtree Street, N.E.
19th Floor
Atlanta, Georgia 30309

s/ Nanette Edwards

ITC^Deltacom/BTI
Nanette S. Edwards
4092 South Memorial Parkway
Huntsville, AL 35802-4343

s/ Donna McNulty

Donna Canzano McNulty
MCImetro Access Transmission Services, LLC,
MCI WorldCom Communications, Inc.
1203 Governors Square Blvd., Suite 201
Tallahassee, FL 32301

s/ Floyd Self

Counsel for MCI
Floyd Self
Messer, Caparello & Self
215 South Monroe St Ste 701
PO Box 1876
Tallahassee Fl 32302-1876

s/ Margaret Ring

Margaret Ring
Director, Regulatory & Governmental Affairs
Network Telephone Corp.
3300 North Pace Boulevard
Pensacola, FL 32505