

law offices Messer, Caparello & Self

A PROFESSIONAL ASSOCIATION

215 SOUTH MONROE STREET, SUITE 701 POST OFFICE BOX 1876 TALLAHASSEE, FLORIDA 32302-1876 TELEPHONE: (850) 222-0720 TELECOPIER: (850) 224-4359 INTERNET: www.lawfla.com

December 31, 2001

RECEIVED-FPSC DEC 31 PM 3: 4

BY HAND DELIVERY

Ms. Blanca Bayó, Director Division of Records and Reporting Room 110, Easley Building Florida Public Service Commission 2540 Shumard Oak Blvd. Tallahassee, Florida 32399-0850

Re: Docket No. 990649A-TP

Dear Ms. Bayó:

CMP COM CTR ECR LEG OPC

PAI RGO

SEC

SER

OTH

Enclosed for filing on behalf of AT&T Communications of the Southern States, Inc. and MCI WorldCom, Inc. are the following documents:

1. An original and fifteen copies of AT&T and MCI's Objections to BellSouth's First Data Request.;

2 An original and fifteen copies of AT&T and MCI's Objections to FPSC Staff's First Set of Interrogatories;

3. An original and fifteen copies of AT&T and MCI's Objections to FPSC Staff's First Request for Production of Documents; and

4. An original and one copy of AT&T and MCI's Notice of Service of its First Set of CAF Interrogatories and First Request for Production to BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc.

RECEIVED & FILED DOCUM RES-DATE 16190 DEC 31 = DEC 31 = 61 FPSC-COMMISSION OL FOL FPSC-COMMISSION CLERK

DOCUME 16192 DEC 31 5

FPSC-COMMISSION CLERK

Ms. Blanca Bayó December 31, 2001 Page 2

7

,

Please acknowledge receipt of these documents by stamping the extra copy of this letter "filed" and returning the same to me.

Thank you for your assistance with this filing.

Sincerely, Noe Tracy W. Hatch

.

TWH/amb Enclosures cc: Donna McNulty, Esq. Parties of Record

SCANNED

BEFORE THE FLORIDA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In re: Investigation into pricing of) unbundled network elements) Docket No. 990649A-TP Filed: December 31, 2001

AT&T AND MCI'S OBJECTIONS TO BELLSOUTH TELECOMMUNICATIONS, INC.'S FIRST DATA REQUEST

AT&T Communications of the Southern States, Inc. (hereinafter "AT&T") and MCI WorldCom, Inc. (hereinafter "MCI"), pursuant to Rules 25-22.034 and 25-22.035, Florida Administrative Code and Rules 1.350 and 1.280(b), Florida Rules of Civil Procedure, hereby submits the following Objections to BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc.'s (hereinafter "BellSouth") First Data Request to AT&T Communications of the Southern States, Inc. and MCI WorldCom, Inc.

The Objections stated herein are preliminary in nature and are made at this time for the purpose of complying with the ten-day requirement set forth in Order No. PSC-00-0540-PCO-TP issued by the Florida Public Service Commission (hereinafter the "Commission") in the above-referenced docket. Should additional grounds for objection be discovered as AT&T and WorldCom prepare its Responses to the above-referenced set of requests, AT&T/MCI reserve the right to supplement, revise, or modify its objections at the time that it serves its Responses on BellSouth. Moreover, should AT&T/MCI determine that a Protective Order is necessary with respect to any of the material requested by BellSouth, AT&T/MCI reserve the right to file a motion with the Commission seeking such an order at the time that it serves its Responses on BellSouth.

DOCUMENT NUMBER-DATE

General Objections

AT&T/MCI make the following General Objections to BellSouth's First Data Requests which will be incorporated by reference into AT&T and WorldCom's specific responses when its Responses are served on BellSouth.

1. AT&T/MCI object to BellSouth's First Data Requests to the extent that it is overly broad, unduly burdensome, oppressive, not permitted by applicable discovery rules, and would require AT&T and WorldCom to disclose information which is privileged.

2. AT&T/MCI have interpreted BellSouth's requests to apply to AT&T/MCI's regulated intrastate operations in Florida and will limit its Responses accordingly. To the extent that any request is intended to apply to matters other than Florida intrastate operations subject to the jurisdiction of the Commission, AT&T/MCI object to such request as irrelevant, overly broad, unduly burdensome, and oppressive.

3. AT&T/MCI object to each and every request and instruction to the extent that such request or instruction calls for information which is exempt from discovery by virtue of the attorneyclient privilege, work product privilege or other applicable privilege.

4. AT&T/MCI object to each and every request insofar as the request is vague, ambiguous, overly broad, imprecise, or utilizes terms that are subject to multiple interpretations but are not properly defined or explained for purposes of these requests. Any Responses provided by AT&T/MCI in response to BellSouth's requests will be provided subject to, and without waiver of, the foregoing objection.

5. AT&T/MCI object to each and every request insofar as the request is not reasonably calculated to lead to the discovery of admissible evidence and is not relevant to the subject matter of this action. AT&T/MCI will attempt to note each instance where this objection applies.

6. AT&T/MCI object to BellSouth's general instructions, definitions or specific discovery requests insofar as they seek to impose obligations on AT&T and WorldCom which exceed the requirements of the Florida Rules of Civil Procedure or Florida law.

7. AT&T/MCI object to providing information to the extent that such information is already in the public record before the Florida Public Service Commission.

8. AT&T/MCI object to each and every request, general instruction, or definition insofar as it is unduly burdensome, expensive, oppressive, or excessively time consuming as written.

9. AT&T/MCI object to each and every request to the extent that the information requested constitutes "trade secrets" which are privileged pursuant to Section 90.506, Florida Statutes. To the extent that BellSouth's requests seek proprietary confidential business information which is not the subject of the "trade secrets" privilege, AT&T/MCI will make such information available to counsel for BellSouth pursuant to an appropriate Protective Agreement, subject to any other general or specific objections contained herein.

10. AT&T/MCI are large corporations with employees located in many different locations in Florida and in other states. In the course of its business, AT&T/MCI create countless documents that are not subject to Florida Public Service Commission or FCC retention of records requirements. These documents are kept in numerous locations and are frequently moved from site to site as employees change jobs or as the business is reorganized. Rather, these responses will

provide all of the information obtained by AT&T/MCI after a reasonable and diligent search conducted in connection with this discovery request. AT&T/MCI will comply with BellSouth's request that a search be conducted of those files that are reasonably expected to contain the requested information. To the extent that the discovery request purports to require more, AT&T/MCI object on the grounds that compliance would impose an undue burden or expense.

11. AT&T/MCI object to the definitions of "AT&T" and "MCI" to the extent that such definitions seek to impose an obligation on AT&T Communications of the Southern States, Inc. and MCI WorldCom, Inc. to respond on behalf of subsidiaries, affiliates, or other persons that are not parties to this case on the grounds that such definition is overly broad, unduly burdensome, óppressive, and not permitted by applicable discovery rules. Without waiver of its general objection, and subject to other general and specific objections, Answers will be provided on behalf of AT&T Communications of the Southern States, Inc. and MCI WorldCom, Inc. which is the entity certificated to provide regulated telecommunications services in Florida and which is a party to this docket. All references to "AT&T" and "MCI" in responding to BellSouth's requests should be taken to mean AT&T Communications of the Southern States, Inc. and MCI WorldCom, Inc.

12. AT&T/MCI object to the definitions of "you" and "your" to the extent that such definitions seek to impose an obligation on AT&T Communications of the Southern States, Inc. and MCI WorldCom, Inc. to respond on behalf of subsidiaries, affiliates, or other persons that are not parties to this case on the grounds that such definition is overly broad, unduly burdensome, oppressive, and not permitted by applicable discovery rules. Without waiver of its general objection, and subject to other general and specific objections, Answers will be provided on behalf of AT&T

Communications of the Southern States, Inc. and MCI WorldCom, Inc. which is the entity certificated to provide regulated telecommunications services in Florida and which is a party to this docket. All references to "AT&T" and "MCI" in responding to BellSouth's requests should be taken to mean AT&T Communications of the Southern States, Inc. and MCI WorldCom, Inc. –

Objections to Specific Requests

Subject to, and without waiver of, the foregoing general objections, AT&T/MCI enter the following specific objections with respect to BellSouth's requests:

DATA REQUEST NO.3: Produce copies of all documents pertaining to the engagement of Mr. Pitkin to perform work on behalf of AT&T and/or MCI in this docket, including but not limited to contracts, engagement letters, status memos and invoices for work performed.

<u>OBJECTION:</u> AT&T/MCI object to this request on the grounds that it is not relevant to the subject matter of this proceeding and is not reasonably calculated to lead to the discovery of admissible evidence.

DATA REQUEST NO. 4: Produce copies of all documents pertaining to the engagement of Mr. Donovan to perform work on behalf of AT&T and/or MCI in this docket, including but not limited to contracts, engagement letters, status memos and invoices for work performed.

OBJECTION: AT&T/MCI object to this request on the grounds that it is not relevant to the subject matter of this proceeding and is not reasonably calculated to lead to the discovery of admissible evidence.

DATA REQUEST NO.5: Produce copies of all documents that AT&T or MCI provided to Mr. Pitkin pertaining to the issues in this proceeding.

OBJECTION: AT&T/MCI object to this request on the grounds that it asks for documents that are protected by the work product doctrine, and that it is oppressive, unduly burdensome, and overly time consuming. Without waiving this objection, AT&T/MCI will attempt to provide responsive documents.

DATA REQUEST NO. 6: Produce copies of all documents that AT&T or MCI provided to Mr. Donovan pertaining to the issues in this proceeding.

OBJECTION: AT&T/MCI object to this request on the grounds that it asks for documents that are protected by the work product doctrine, and that it is oppressive, unduly burdensome, and overly time consuming. Without waiving this objection, AT&T/MCI will attempt to provide responsive documents.

DATA REQUEST NO. 12: Produce copies of all documents memorializing or noting the time Brian Pitkin of [sic] any other employee or contractor of FTI Consulting, Inc. spent performing work in this proceeding, including but not limited to logs, time sheets, and notes.

OBJECTION: AT&T/MCI object to this request on the grounds that it is not relevant to the subject matter of this proceeding and is not reasonably calculated to lead to the discovery of admissible evidence.

DATA REQUEST NO. 13: Produce copies of all documents memorializing or noting the time John C. Donovan spent performing work in this proceeding, including but not limited to logs, sheets, and notes.

OBJECTION: AT&T/MCI object to this request on the grounds that it is not relevant to the subject matter of this proceeding and is not reasonably calculated to lead to the discovery of admissible evidence.

SUBMITTED this 31st day of December 2001.

TRACY W. HATCH, ESQ. FLOYD R. SELF, ESQ. MESSER, CAPARELLO & SELF, P. A. Post Office Box 1876 Tallahassee, FL 32302-1876 (850) 222-0720

Attorney for AT&T Communications of the Southern States, Inc.

.

and

Donna McNulty, Esq. MCI WorldCom, Inc. The Atrium Building, Suite 105 325 John Knox Road Tallahassee, FL 32303

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that a true and correct copy of AT&T and MCI's Objections to BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc.'s First Date Request in Docket 990649A-TP has been served on the following parties by Hand Delivery (*) and/or U. S. Mail this 31st day of December, 2001.

Wayne Knight, Esq.*
Division of Legal Services, Room 370
Florida Public Service Commission
2540 Shumard Oak Blvd.
Tallahassee, FL 32399-0850

Nancy B. White c/o Nancy H. Sims BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. 150 South Monroe Street, Suite 400 Tallahassee, FL 32301

Claudia Davant-DeLoach, Esq. AT&T 101 N. Monroe St., Suite 700 Tallahassee, FL 32301

Jim Lämoureux, Esq. AT&T 1200 Peachtree St., Suite 8068 Atlanta, GA 30309

Jeffrey Whalen, Esq. John Fons, Esq. Ausley Law Firm P.O. Box 391 Tallahassee, FL 32302

Michael A. Gross Vice President, Regulatory Affairs & Regulatory Counsel -Florida Cable Telecommunications Assoc., Inc. 246 E. 6th Avenue Tallahassee, FL 32301

Kimberly Caswell Verizon Select Services P.O. Box 110, FLTC0007 Tampa, FL 33601-0110

Donna McNulty, Esq. WorldCom The Atrium Building, Suite 105 325 John Knox Road Tallahassee, FL 32303

Mr. Brian Sulmonetti WorldCom, Inc. 6 Concourse Parkway, Suite 3200 Atlanta, GA 30328 Marc W. Dunbar, Esq. Pennington, Moore, Wilkinson, Bell & Dunbar, P.A. P.O. Box 10095 Tallahassee, FL 32302-2095

Charles J. Rehwinkel Sprint-Florida, Incorporated MC FLTHO0107 P.O. Box 2214 Tallahassee, FL 32399-2214

Mark Buechele Supra Telecom 1311 Executive Center Drive, Suite 200 Tallahassee, FL 32301

Carolyn Marek Vice President of Regulatory Affairs Southeast Region Time Warner Communications 233 Bramerton Court Franklin, TN 37069

Ms. Wanda Montano US LEC of Florida, Inc. 6801 Morrison Blvd Charlotte, NC 28211-3599

Vicki Kaufman, Esq. Joe McGlothlin, Esq. McWhirter, Reeves, McGlothlin, Davidson, Rief & Bakas, P.A. 117 S. Gadsden Street Tallahassee, FL. 32301

Patrick Wiggins Charles Pellegrini Katz, Kutter Law Firm 106 East College Avenue, 12th Floor Tallahassee, FL 32301

Richard D. Melson Hopping Green Sams & Smith, P.A. P.O. Box 6526 Tallahassee, FL 32314

-- -- -----

BlueStar Networks, Inc. Norton Cutler/Michael Bressman 5 Corporate Centre 801 Crescent Centre Drive, Suite 600 Franklin, TN 37067

Mr. John Spilman Broadslate Networks of Florida, Inc. 675 Peter Jefferson Parkway, Suite 310 Charlottesville, VA 22911

Ms. Catherine F. Boone Covad Communications Company 10 Glenlake Parkway, Suite 650 Atlanta, GA 30328-3495

Florida Digital Network, Inc. 390 North Orange Avenue, Suite 2000 Orlando, Florida 32801

Mr. Don Sussman Network Access Solutions Corporation Three Dulles Tech Center 13650 Dulles Technology Drive Herndon, VA 20171-4602

Rodney L. Joyce Shook, Hardy & Bacon LLP 600 14th Street, NW, Suite 800 Washington, DC 20005-2004

Michael Sloan Swidler & Berlin 3000 K Street, NW #300 Washington, DC 20007-5116

George S. Ford Z-Tel Communications, Inc. 601 S. Harbour Island Blvd. Tampa, FL 33602-5706

Tracy