

Tracy Hatch Senior Attorney Law and Government Affairs Southern Region

Suite 700 101 N. Monroe Street Tallahassee, FL 32301 850-425-6360

February 23, 2004

BY OVERNIGHT MAIL

Ms. Blanca Bayó, Director
The Commission Clerk and Administrative Services
Room 110, Easley Building
Florida Public Service Commission
2540 Shumard Oak Blvd.
Tallahassee, Florida 32399-0850

Re: Docket No. 030852-TP

Dear Ms. Bayó:

Enclosed for filing are an original and fifteen copies of Exhibits A and B to AT&T's Response to Verizon's Motion to Compel, which were inadvertently omitted from AT&T's filing on Monday, February 16, 2004 in the above referenced docket.

Please acknowledge receipt of this letter by stamping the extra copy of this letter "filed," and return to me at the time of filing.

Thank you for your assistance.

Sincerely yours,

Cracy thatch than

TWH/las Enclosure

cc: Parties of Record

BEFORE THE FLORIDA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In Re: Implementation of Requirements)
Arising From Federal Communications)
Commission Triennial UNE Review:)
Location Specific-Review for DS1, DS3,)
And Dark Fiber Loops and RouteSpecific Review for DS1, DS3, and Dark)
Fiber Transport

Docket No.: 030852-TP

AT&T COMMUNICATIONS OF THE SOUTHERN STATES, LLC'S

OBJECTIONS TO VERIZON FLORIDA, INC.'S

FIRST REQUEST FOR ADMISSIONS (Nos. 1-2),

FIRST SET OF INTERROGATORIES (Nos. 1-24) AND

FIRST REQUEST FOR PRODUCTION OF DOCUMENTS (Nos. 1-11)

AT&T Communications of the Southern States, LLC (hereinafter "AT&T"), pursuant to the Order Establishing Procedure, Order No. PSC-03-1054-PCO-TP, issued September 22, 2003, and Second Order on Procedure, Order No. PSC-03-1265-PCO-TP issued November 7, 2003 (hereinafter collectively "Procedural Orders"), by the Florida Public Service Commission (hereinafter "Commission"), Rule 28-106.206 of the Florida Administrative Code, and Rules 1.280, 1.340, 1.350 and 1.370 of the Florida Rules of Civil Procedure, objects generally to Verizon Florida, Inc.'s (hereinafter "Verizon") First Request for Admissions, First Set of Interrogatories and First Request for Production of Documents to AT&T Communications of the Southern States, LLC.

<u>OVERVIEW</u>

AT&T files these objections for purposes of complying with the seven (7) day requirement set forth in the *Procedural Orders*. These objections are preliminary in nature. Should additional grounds for objection be

discovered as AT&T prepares its responses to any discovery, or at any time prior to hearing, AT&T reserves the right to supplement, revise, and/or modify these objections.

GENERAL OBJECTIONS

AT&T makes the following general objections to the Request for Admission, Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents which will be incorporated by reference into AT&T's specific responses when AT&T responds to the Request for Admission, Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents.

1. Instructions

- A. AT&T objects to the "Instructions" section of Verizon's First Request for Admissions, First Set of Interrogatories and First Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the "instructions" operate to impose discovery obligations on AT&T inconsistent with, or beyond the scope of, what is permitted under the *Procedural Orders* and the applicable Florida Rules of Civil Procedure. Subject to the foregoing, and without waiving any objections, responses will be provided in accordance with the *Procedural Orders* and the applicable Florida Rules of Civil Procedure.
- B. AT&T objects to the "Instructions" section of Verizon's First Request for Admissions, First Set of Interrogatories and First Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the "instructions" operate to seek disclosure of the mental impressions, conclusions, opinions, or legal theories of any attorney or other representative of AT&T concerning the subject of litigation without the requisite showing under Rule 1.280(b)(3) of the Florida Rules of Civil Procedure.
- C. AT&T objects to the "Instructions" section of Verizon's First Set of Interrogatories and First Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the "instructions" operate to seek disclosure of "all" information in AT&T's "possession, custody or control" and to the extent that said "instruction" requires AT&T to provide information or materials beyond its present knowledge, recollection or possession. With respect thereto, AT&T has employees located in many different locations in Florida and other states. In the course of conducting business on a nationwide basis, AT&T creates numerous documents that are not subject to either the Commission or FCC record retention requirements. These documents are kept in numerous locations and frequently are moved from location to location as employees change jobs or as business objectives change. Therefore, it is impossible for AT&T to affirm that every responsive document in existence has been provided in response to those

Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents. Instead, where provided, AT&T's responses will provide all information obtained by AT&T after a reasonable and diligent search conducted in connection with those Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents. Such search will include only a review of those files that are reasonably expected to contain the requested information. To the extent that the instructions require more, AT&T objects on the grounds that compliance would be unduly burdensome, expensive, oppressive, or excessively time consuming to provide such responsive information.

2. Definitions

- A. AT&T objects to the "Definitions" section of Verizon's First Request for Admissions, First Set of Interrogatories and First Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that such terms are overly broad, unduly burdensome, irrelevant, oppressive and not reasonably calculated to lead to the discovery of admissible evidence pursuant to the *Procedural Orders*, Rule 28-106.206 of the Florida Administrative Code, and Rules 1.280, 1.340, 1.350, and 1.370 of the Florida Rules of Civil Procedure. Furthermore, AT&T objects to the "Definitions" section to the extent that it utilizes terms that are subject to multiple interpretations, but are not properly defined or explained for purposes of these Requests for Admission, Interrogatories and Requests for Production of Documents.
- B. AT&T objects to the "Definitions" section of Verizon's First Request for Admissions, First Set of Interrogatories and First Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the definitions operate to include the discovery of information protected by attorney/client privilege, the accountant/client privilege, the work product doctrine or any other applicable privilege.
- C. AT&T objects to the "Definitions" section of Verizon's First Request for Admissions, First Set of Interrogatories and First Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the definitions operate to include the discovery of information and/or materials containing the mental impressions, conclusions, opinions or legal theories of any attorney or other representative of AT&T concerning the subject of the proceeding and prepared and developed in anticipation of litigation pursuant to Rule 1.280(b)(3) of the Florida Rules of Civil Procedure without the requisite showing from Verizon that it has substantial need of the requested information and materials in the preparation of the case and is unable without undue hardship to obtain the substantial equivalent of the materials by other means.
- D. AT&T objects to the "Definitions" section of Verizon's First Request for Admissions, First Set of Interrogatories and First Request for

Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the definitions operate to impose discovery obligations on AT&T inconsistent with, or beyond the scope of, what is permitted under the *Procedural Orders* and other applicable Florida law.

- E. AT&T objects to the "Definitions" section of Verizon's First Request for Admissions, First Set of Interrogatories and First Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the definitions operate to seek discovery of matters other than those subject to the jurisdiction of the Commission pursuant to the Federal Communications Commission's (hereinafter "FCC") Triennial Review Order, Florida Administrative Code and Florida Statutes.
- F. AT&T objects to the "Definitions" section of Verizon's First Request for Admissions, First Set of Interrogatories and First Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the definitions operate to seek disclosure of information that is proprietary confidential information or a "trade secret" without the issuance of an appropriate Protective Order or Confidential Classification as outlined by the *Procedural Orders*, §364.183 of the Florida Statutes, §90.506 of the Florida Statutes and Rule 25-22.006.
- G. AT&T objects to the terms "you," "your," "your company," "AT&T," "person" and "persons" to the extent that the definitions include natural persons or entities which are not parties to this proceeding, not subject to the jurisdiction of the Commission, and not subject to the applicable discovery rules. Subject to the foregoing, and without waiving any objection, general or specific, unless otherwise ordered, responses will be provided on behalf of AT&T Communications of the Southern States, LLC, which is a certificated carrier authorized to provide regulated communications services in Florida and which is a party to this proceeding.

General Objections to Request for Admission, Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents

- A. AT&T objects to Verizon's First Request for Admissions, First Set of Interrogatories and First Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the Request for Admission, Interrogatories and Requests for Production of Documents are overly broad, unduly burdensome, irrelevant, oppressive and not reasonably calculated to lead to the discovery of admissible evidence pursuant to the *Procedural Orders*, Rule 28-106.206 of the Florida Administrative Code, and Rules 1.280, 1.340, 1.350 and 1.370 of the Florida Rules of Civil Procedure.
- B. AT&T objects to Verizon's First Request for Admissions, First Set of Interrogatories and First Request for Production of Documents to

AT&T to the extent that the Request for Admission, Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents purport to seek discovery of information protected by attorney/client privilege, the accountant/client privilege, the work product doctrine or any other applicable privilege.

- C. AT&T objects to Verizon's First Request for Admissions, First Set of Interrogatories and First Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the Request for Admission, Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents purport to seek discovery of information and/or materials containing the mental impressions, conclusions, opinions or legal theories of any attorney or other representative of AT&T concerning the subject of the proceeding and prepared and developed in anticipation of litigation pursuant to Rule 1.280(b)(3) of the Florida Rules of Civil Procedure without the requisite showing from Verizon that it has substantial need of the requested information and materials in the preparation of the case and in unable without undue hardship to obtain the substantial equivalent of the materials by other means.
- D. AT&T objects to Verizon's First Request for Admissions, First Set of Interrogatories and First Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the Request for Admission, Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents purport to impose discovery obligations on AT&T inconsistent with, or beyond the scope of, what is permitted under the *Procedural Orders* and the applicable Florida Rules of Civil Procedure.
- E. AT&T objects to Verizon's First Request for Admissions, First Set of Interrogatories and First Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the Request for Admission, Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents purport to seek discovery of matters other than those subject to the jurisdiction of the Commission pursuant to the FCC's Triennial Review Order, Florida Administrative Code and Florida Statutes.
- F. AT&T objects to Verizon's First Request for Admissions, First Set of Interrogatories and First Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the Request for Admission, Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents purport to seek disclosure of information that is proprietary confidential information or a "trade secret" without the issuance of an appropriate Protective Order or Confidential Classification as outlined by the *Procedural Orders*, §364.183 of the Florida Statutes, §90-506 of the Florida Statutes, and Rule 25-22.006.
- G. AT&T objects to all Request for Admission, Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents which require the disclosure of

information which already is in the public domain or otherwise on record with the Commission or the FCC.

- H. AT&T objects to Verizon's First Request for Admissions, First Set of Interrogatories and First Request for Production of Documents to AT&T to the extent that the Request for Admission, Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents seek information and discovery of facts known and opinions held by experts acquired and/or developed in anticipation of litigation or for hearing and outside the scope of discoverable information pursuant to Rule 1.280(4) of the Florida Rules of Civil Procedure.
- I. Pursuant to the *Procedural Orders*, the Triennial Review Order, Rule 28-106.206 of the Florida Administrative Code, and Rules 1.280, 1.340, 1.350 and 1.370 of the Florida Rules of Civil Procedure, to the extent that Verizon's Request for Admission, Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents request specific financial, business or proprietary information regarding AT&T's economic business model, AT&T objects to providing or producing any such information on the grounds that those Request for Admission, Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents presume that the market entry analysis is contingent upon AT&T's economic business model instead of the hypothetical business model contemplated by the Triennial Review Order.

Respectfully submitted, this the 23rd day of December, 2003.

Tracy Hatch

AT&T Communications of the Southern States, LLC

101 North Monroe Street,

Suite 700

Tallahassee, FL 32301

(850) 425-6360



Tracy Hatch Senior Attorney Law and Government Affairs Southern Region Suite 700 101 N Monroe Street Tallahassee, FL 32301 850-425-6360

February 20, 2004

BY OVERNIGHT DELIVERY

Mr. Richard Chapkis 201 N. Franklin Street, MCFLTC0007 Tampa, FL 33601

Re: Docket Nos 030852-TP

Dear Mr Chapkis

Attached please find AT&T Communications of the Southern States, LLC's Supplemental Responses to Verizon's First Set of Interrogatories in the above-referenced docket.

A copy of the filing was also e-mailed to you February 20, 2004

If you have any questions, please let me know.

Sincerely yours,

Tracy W. Hatch

TWH/las Enclosure AT&T's Supplemental Response to Verizon's Request for Admissions
First Set of Interrogatories (Nos. 1-24), and
First Request for Production of Documents
Docket 030852-TP
February 20, 2004

REQUEST

Verizon's First Set of Interrogatories

DATED.

December 22, 2003

Interrogatory 1:

Identify all fiber optic transport facilities in Florida that you own, by street address of its origination and termination points (or if no termination point, by the location of a fiber ring), as well as a description of the route between those points (For purposes of responding to this question, your own transport facilities include facilities that you own solely or jointly, as well as facilities that you have obtained from another entity on a long-term,

indefeasible right of use basis) (For the definitions of transport

facilities or transport services for this and all other

interrogatories, see Instruction M.)

Response

AT&T is not a self-provider of transport as defined by the TRO and therefore has no input to provide.

AT&T self-provides facilities that connect, for example, our switch to ILEC office A and facilities that connect our switch to ILEC office B using portions of a fiber that passes near/through both A and B, but does not either (1) connect A to B or (2) take on a dedicated basis any "traffic" that originates at either one to the other and therefore AT&T's facilities are not dedicated transport as defined by the TRO and new FCC rule

Supplemental Response:

See Response above In addition to the fact that AT&T is not a self-provider of transport as defined by the TRO, AT&T is not a self-provider as defined by Verizon



Tracy Hatch Senior Attorney Law and Government Affairs Southern Region

Suite 700 101 N. Monroe Street Tallahassee, FL 32301 850-425-6360

January 12, 2004

BY OVERNIGHT MAIL

Ms. Blanca Bayó, Director
The Commission Clerk and Administrative Services
Room 110, Easley Building
Florida Public Service Commission
2540 Shumard Oak Blvd.
Tallahassee, Florida 32399-0850

Re: Docket No. 030852-TP

Dear Ms. Bayó:

Enclosed for filing are an original and fifteen copies of Exhibits A and B to AT&T's Response to Verizon's Motion to Compel, which were inadvertently omitted from AT&T's filing on Monday, February 16, 2004 in the above referenced docket.

Please acknowledge receipt of this letter by stamping the extra copy of this letter "filed," and return to me at the time of filing.

Thank you for your assistance.

Sincerely yours,

Tracy W. Hatch

TWH/las Enclosure

cc: Parties of Record

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE DOCKET NO. 030852-TP

I HEREBY CERTIFY that a copy of the foregoing has been furnished via electronic mail or as indicated this 23rd day of February, 2004 to the following parties of record:

	BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. *
Adam Teitzman	Nancy B. White
Office of the General Counsel	c/o Ms. Nancy H Sims
Florida Public Service Commission	150 South Monroe Street, Suite 400
2540 Shumard Oak Boulevard	Tallahassee, FL 32301-1556
Tallahassee, FL 32399-0850	Phone: (850) 224-7798
Email: ateitzma@psc.state.fl.us	Fax: 222-8640
Eman. <u>atenzina@psc.state.n.us</u>	Email: nancy.sims @bellsouth.com
	Email: <u>nancy.sims weensoun.com</u>
Florida Cable Telecom. Assoc., Inc.	MCI WorldCom Communications, Inc. *
Michael A. Gross	Ms. Donna C. McNulty
246 E. 6th Avenue, Suite 100	1203 Governors Square Blvd., Suite 201
Tallahassee, FL 32303	Tallahassee, FL 32301-2960
Phone: 850-681-1990	Phone: (850) 219-1008
Fax: 681-9676	Fax: 219-1018
Email: mgross@fcta.com	Email: donna.menulty \(\hat{u} \) weom.com
Sprint - Florida*	KMC Telecom III. LLC *
Susan S. Masterton	Marva Brown Johnson. Esq.
1313 Blairstone Road	1755 North Brown Road
MC: FLTLHO0107	Lawrenceville, GA 30043-8119
Tallahassee, FL 32301	Phone: (678) 985-6261
	Fax: (678) 985-6213
Phone: (850) 847-0244 Fax: 878-0777	Email: marva.johnson@kmctelecom.com
	Email, marva.jomison a kinetelecom.com
Email: susan.masterton@mail.sprint.com	ITC^DeltaCom *
Covad Communications Company*	Nanette Edwards
Charles E. Watkins	
1230 Peachtree Street, NE	4092 South Memorial Parkway
19 th Floor	Huntsville, AL 35802
Atlanta, GA 30309	Phone: (256) 382-3856
Phone: (404) 942-3492	
Email: gwatkins@covad.com	
McWhirter Reeves McGlothlin Davidson*	Verizon Florida Inc. *
Kaufman & Arnold, PA	Mr. Richard Chapkis
Vicki Gordon Kaufman	201 N. Franklin Street, MCFLTC0007
117 South Gadsden Street	Tampa, FL 33601
Tallahassee, FL 32301	Phone: (813) 483-2606
Phone: (850) 222-2525	Fax: (813) 204-\$870
Email: vkaufman <u>a mac-law.com</u>	Email: richard.chapkis a verizon com
Allegiance Telecom of Florida, Inc.	Allegiance Telecom, Inc.
Charles V. Gerkin, Jr.	Terry Larkin
9201 North Central Expressway	700 East Betterfield Road
Dallas, TX 75231	Lombard, IL 60148
Phone: (469) 259-4051	Phone: 630-522-6453
Fax: 770-234-5965	Email: terry.larkin@algx.com
Email: charles.gerkin@algx.com	
	Florida Competitive Carriers Assoc.
FDN Communications	C/O McWhirter Law Firm
1 DIA COMMUNICATIONS	O/O ITIE WILLIAM I IIII

7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7	Learnh McClathlin Wiele Voutman
Matthew Feil/Scott Kassman	Joseph McGlothlin/Vicki Kaufman
390 North Orange Avenue, Suite 2000	117 S. Gadsden Street
Orlando, FL 32801-1640	Tallahassee, FL 32301
Phone: (407) 835-0460	Phone: (850) 222-2525
Fax: (407) 835-0309	Fax: (850) 222-5606
Email: mfeil@mail.fdn.com/skassman@mail.fdn.com	email: jmcglothlin@mac-
	law.com/vkaufman@mac-law.com
MCI WorldCom Communications, Inc.(GA) *	Messer Law Firm*
De O'Roark, Esq.	Floyd Self/Norman Horton
Six Concourse Parkway. Suite 600	P. O. Box 1876
Atlanta, GA 30328	Tallahassee, FL 32302-1876
Email: de.oroark@wcom.com	Phone: (850) 222-0720
	Fax: (850) 224-4359
Moyle, Flanigan, Katz, Raymond & Sheehan, P.A.	NewSouth Communications Corp. *
Jon C. Moyle, Jr.	Jake E. Jennings
The Perkins House	Two North Main Center
118 North Gadsden Street	Greenville, SC 29601-2719
Tallahassee, FL 32301	Phone: (864) 672-5877
Phone: (850) 681-3828	Fax: (864) 672-5313
Fax: 681-8788	Email: jejennings@newsouth.com
Email: jmoylejr@/moylelaw.com	
Xspedius Communications	BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc.*
Ms. Rabinai E. Carson	Douglas Lackey
5555 Winghaven Blvd., Suite 300	675 W. Peachtree Street, Suite 4300
O'Fallon, MO 63366-3868	Atlanta, GA 30375
Phone: (301) 361-4220	
Fax: (301) 361-4277	
Email: rabinai.carson a xspedius.com	
Supra Telecommunications and Info. Systems	Supra Telecommunications and Info.
Jorge Cruz-Bustillo	Systems
2620 S.W. 27 th Avenue	Jonathan Audu
Miami, FL 33133	1311 Executive Center Drive, Suite 220
Phone: (305) 476-4252	Tallahassee, FL 32301-5027
Fax: (305) 443-1078	Phone: (850) 402-0510
Email: Jorge.cruz-bustillo@stis.com	Fax: (850) 402-0522
Email: Jorge-orde-ordemore-scott	Jonathan.audu@stis.com
Nuvox Communications, Inc.	Miller Isar, Inc.
Bo Russell	Andrew O. Isar
301 North Main Street	7901 Skansie Avenue, Ste. 240
Greenville, SC 29601	Gig Harbor, WA 98335
Greenvine, Se 27001	

Casey & Gentz, L.L.P. Bill Magness 919 Congress Avenue, Suite 1060 Austin, TX 78701 Phone: 512-225-0019 Fax: 512-480-9200	Sprint (KS) Kenneth A. Schifman 6450 Sprint Parkway Mailstop: KSOPHN0212-2A303 Overland Park, KS 66251-6100 Phone: 913-315-9783
Sprint (NC) H. Edward Phillips, III 14111 Capital Blvd. Mailstop: NCWKFR0313-3161 Wake Forest, NC 27587-5900 Phone: 919-554-7870	-

Tracy W. Hatch, Esq.