

**BEFORE THE  
FLORIDA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION**

_____ )	
Complaint and Request for Summary Disposition )	Docket No. 040028-TP
BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. Against )	
NewSouth Communications Corp., To Enforce )	
Contract Audit Provisions )	Filed: July 5, 2005
_____ )	

**REQUEST FOR OFFICIAL RECOGNITION**

NewSouth Communications Corp. (NewSouth), through its undersigned counsel, pursuant to rule 90.202, Florida Rules of Evidence, and section 120.569(2)(i), Florida Statutes, requests Official Recognition of the attached Temporary Restraining Order granting NuVox's Motion for Temporary Restraining Order against BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. (BellSouth), the Kentucky Public Service Commission (Kentucky Commission), Mark David Goss, in his official capacity as Chairman of the Kentucky Commission, and W. Gregory Coker, in his official capacity as Commissioner of the Kentucky Commission, issued by the United States District Court for the Eastern District of Kentucky, in *NuVox Communications, Inc. v. BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc.; Kentucky Public Service Commission, et al.*, Case No.: 05-41-KKC, on July 1, 2005. On June 20, 2005, NuVox filed for injunctive relief from the Kentucky Commission's decision granting, in part, BellSouth's motion for summary disposition and permitting an audit of certain of NuVox's converted enhanced extended link (EEL) circuits in Kentucky. See, *BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. v. NuVox Communications, Inc., Order*, Case No. 2004-00295 (Apr. 15, 2005). The Court granted NuVox's motion for a temporary restraining order, thereby enjoining BellSouth from engaging in an audit of NuVox's Kentucky circuits.

John J. Heitmann  
Jennifer M. Kashatus  
KELLEY DRYE & WARREN LLP  
1200 19<sup>th</sup> Street, NW  
Suite 500  
Washington, D.C. 20036  
(202) 955-9600 (telephone)  
(202) 955-9792 (facsimile)  
[jheitmann@kelleydrye.com](mailto:jheitmann@kelleydrye.com)  
[jkashatus@kelleydrye.com](mailto:jkashatus@kelleydrye.com)

S/ Vicki Gordon Kaufman  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Jon Moyle, Jr.  
Vicki Gordon Kaufman  
Moyle, Flanigan, Katz, Raymond and  
Sheehan, P.A.  
The Perkins House  
118 North Gadsden Street  
Tallahassee, FL 32301  
(850) 681-3828  
(850) 681-8788 (facsimile)  
[jmoylejr@moylelaw.com](mailto:jmoylejr@moylelaw.com)  
[vkaufman@moylelaw.com](mailto:vkaufman@moylelaw.com)

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

**I HEREBY CERTIFY** that a true and correct copy of the foregoing Request for Official Recognition was served via electronic mail and US mail this 5<sup>th</sup> day of July, 2005 on the following parties of record:

Jason Rojas  
Jeremy Susac  
Office of the General Counsel  
Florida Public Service Commission  
2540 Shumard Oak Boulevard  
Tallahassee, Florida 32399-0850

Kip Edenfield  
Theodore Marcus  
BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc.  
c/o Nancy H. Sims  
150 South Monroe Street, Suite 400  
Tallahassee, FL 32301-1556

S/ Vicki Gordon Kaufman  
Vicki Gordon Kaufman

JUL -1 2005

AT FRANKFORT  
LESLIE G WHITMER  
CLERK U S DISTRICT COURT

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF KENTUCKY  
FRANKFORT

CIVIL ACTION NO. 05-41-KKC

NUVOX COMMUNICATIONS, INC.,

PLAINTIFF

v.

**TEMPORARY RESTRAINING ORDER**

BELLSOUTH TELECOMMUNICATIONS, INC.;  
KENTUCKY PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION;  
MARK DAVID GOSS, *in his official capacity*  
*as chairman of the Kentucky Commission*, and  
W. GREGORY COKER, *in his official*  
*capacity as Commissioner of the Kentucky Commission*,

DEFENDANTS

\* \* \* \* \*

This matter is before the Court on Plaintiff NuVox Communication, Inc.'s ("NuVox") Motion for Temporary Restraining Order and Preliminary Injunction [R. 3]. NuVox has moved pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 65 to enjoin Defendant Kentucky Public Service Commission ("PSC") and its Defendant Commissioners, Mark David Goss and W. Gregory Coker, from enforcing the PSC's order granting Defendant BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc.'s ("BellSouth") motion for summary disposition in part in the action entitled *BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. v. NuVox Communications, Inc.*, Order, Case No. 2004-00295 (Apr. 15, 2005) ("PSC Order") and enjoining Defendant BellSouth from conducting an audit of NuVox's fifteen (15) converted enhanced extended loops ("EELs") or any other NuVox circuit located in Kentucky. NuVox noticed Defendants of its motions at the time of filing. The Court conducted a hearing on the motion for temporary restraining order with counsel representing all parties on June 28, 2005.

Having considered NuVox's Verified Complaint and the attachments thereto [R. 1], NuVox's Memorandum in Support of Plaintiff's Motion and the attachments thereto [R. 3], BellSouth's Memorandum in Opposition and the attachments thereto [R. 7], the Response in Opposition filed by the PSC and its Commissioners [R. 9], and the excellent arguments made by counsel at the hearing, the Court finds that while the parties desire a quick resolution of the issues raised given the nature of the dispute and its potential effect

on the local telephone service industry, those same reasons mandate that the Court take a reasonably cautious approach to the issues raised. However, the Court anticipates taking only a relatively short time to reach its decision and has established a briefing schedule for final resolution of the case in the June 28, 2005, hearing minute order filed at R. 16.

Because the Court believes the issues can be fully and thoroughly resolved in a reasonably quick time, the Court will hereby grant NuVox's request to temporarily restrain and enjoin Defendants PSC and its Commissioners from enforcing the PSC Order, and temporarily restrain and enjoin BellSouth from conducting or causing an independent auditor to audit any of NuVox's EELs located in Kentucky. While the Court cannot determine at this time whether one party has a greater likelihood of success than any other party, the Court finds that NuVox would suffer *substantial* harm without the issuance of a restraining order should NuVox ultimately prevail on the merits of its claims. On the other hand, BellSouth will not be *substantially* harmed by restraining them from conducting the audit for a reasonably short period. Should BellSouth prevail on the merits, it will be able to conduct its audit and seek the same amount of monetary damages should the audit reveal that the EELs in question are not being used for a significant amount of local exchange service. The Court also finds that the PSC and the Commissioners would not be substantially harmed by a temporary restraint on enforcement of the PSC Order. At this time the Court cannot determine whether the public interest weighs in favor of one party over another.

Accordingly, **IT IS HEREBY ORDERED** as follows:

1. As of June 28, 2005, Defendant Kentucky Public Service Commission and its Commissioners and all of their employees, assigns, servants, and representatives, attorneys and agents, as well as any and all persons in the active concert or participation with them, are hereby **TEMPORARILY ENJOINED AND RESTRAINED** from enforcing the order granting Defendant BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc.'s motion for summary disposition in part in the action entitled *BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. v. NuVox Communications, Inc.*, Order, Case No. 2004-00295 (Apr-15;

2005) ("PSC Order").

2. As of June 28, 2005, Defendant BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc., and all of its employees, assigns, servants, and representatives, attorneys and agents, as well as any and all persons in active concert or participation with it, are hereby **TEMPORARILY ENJOINED AND RESTRAINED** from conducting an audit of any NuVox converted EELs or other NuVox circuit located in Kentucky.
3. This Order shall expire upon the Court's decision on NuVox's motion for preliminary injunction, which the Court will consider according to the schedule set forth in the June 28, 2005, hearing minute order filed at R. 16.
4. As security for the issuance of this Order, Plaintiff NuVox is required to post a bond in the amount of \$250,000 for the payment of such costs and damages as may be incurred or suffered by the Defendant BellSouth if it is found to have been wrongfully restrained.

ENTERED this the 1<sup>st</sup> day of July, 2005.



Signed By:

Karen K. Caldwell *KKC*

United States District Judge

**Other Orders/Judgments**3:05-cv-00041-KKC NuVox Communications Inc. v. BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. et al**U.S. District Court****Eastern District of Kentucky**

## Notice of Electronic Filing

The following transaction was received from Dearborn, Christy entered on 7/1/2005 at 3:35 PM EST and filed on 7/1/2005

**Case Name:** NuVox Communications Inc. v. BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. et al

**Case Number:** 3:05-cv-41

**Filer:**

**Document Number:** 18

**Docket Text:**

TEMPORARY RESTRAINING ORDER: 1) As of 6/28/2005, dft KY Public Service Commission and its Commissioners, employees...are TEMPORARILY ENJOINED AND RESTRAINED from enforcing the order entitled "BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. v. NuVox Communications, Inc.," Case No. 2004-00295 (Apr 15, 2005) ("PSC Order"). 2) As of 6/28/2005 BellSouth and all employess... are TEMPORARILY ENJOINED AND RESTRINED from conducting an audit of any NuVox converted EELs or other NuVox circuit located in Kentucky 3) This Order shall expire upon Court's decision on NuVox's motion for preliminary Injunction, which the Court will consider according to schedule set forth in the 6/28/2005 hearing minute order filed at R. 16. 4) As security of this Order, Plaintiff NuVox is required to post a bond in the amount of \$250,000.00 for payment of such costs and damages as may be incurred or suffered by dft, BellSouth if it is found to have been wrongfully restrained. Signed by Judge Karen K. Caldwell. (CBD)cc: COR, Finance

The following document(s) are associated with this transaction:

**Document description:**Main Document

**Original filename:**n/a

**Electronic document Stamp:**

[STAMP dcecfStamp\_ID=1033394914 [Date=7/1/2005] [FileNumber=574462-0]  
[89fbdca71c6eadaf3cd8622e5b4500d8764bd810e95dbbab3b453f9a55a5b92d77ef1  
c4279a9fe7fffb8a4c74552c05b7c109e7f862b8b0036b2a415ba6a0ac8]]

**3:05-cv-41 Notice will be electronically mailed to:**

Amy E. Dougherty aedougherty@ky.gov, elainea.wesley@ky.gov

Mark R. Overstreet moverstreet@stites.com, lsmith@stites.com

Holly C. Wallace holly.wallace@dinslaw.com,

**3:05-cv-41 Notice will be delivered by other means to:**

Dorothy J. Chambers  
BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc.  
601 W. Chestnut Street  
Room 407  
P.O. Box 32410  
Louisville, KY 40232

John J. Heitmann  
Kelley Drye & Warren, LLP  
1200 19th N.W.  
Suite 500  
Washington, DC 20036

Stephanie A. Joyce  
Kelley Drye & Warren, LLP

1200 19th N.W.  
Suite 500  
Washington, DC 20036

Jennifer M. Kashatus  
Kelley Drye & Warren, LLP  
1200 19th N.W.  
Suite 500  
Washington, DC 20036

Theodore C. Marcus  
Bellsouth Legal Department  
675 W. Peachtree Street, N.E.  
Suite 4300  
Atlanta, GA 30375

John E. Selent  
Dinsmore & Shohl  
500 W. Jefferson  
1400 PNC Plaza  
Louisville, KY 40202

Cheryl R. Winn  
601 W. Chestnut Street  
Room 407  
Louisville, KY 40203