



Fort Lauderdale Jacksonville Miami New York Orlando Tallahassee Tampa Washington, DC West Palm Beach Suite 1200 106 East College Avenue Tallahassee, FL 32301 www.akerman.com

850 224 9634 tel 850 222 0103 fax

February 27, 2006

VIA HAND DELIVERY

Blanca S. Bayó, Director Division of Commission Clerk and Administrative Services Florida Public Service Commission 2540 Shumard Oak Boulevard Tallahassee, FL 32399-0850

Re: Docket No. 041269-TP - Petition to Establish Generic Docket to Consider Amendments to Interconnection Agreements Resulting from Changes of Law, by BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc.

Dear Ms. Bayó:

CMP	9844A0N-9999
COM	Enclosed for filing in the above-referenced Docket on behalf of Supra Telecommunications and Information Systems, Inc. (Supra), Florida Digital Network, Inc. d/b/a
CTR	FDN Communications, Inc. (FDN), Nuvox Communications, Inc./NewSouth Communications
ECR	Corp. (Nuvox/NewSouth), Xspedius Communications, LLC (Xspedius), and DIECA Communications, Inc. d/b/a Covad Communications Co. (Covad) (the "Joint Petitioners") are the
GCL	original and fifteen copies of the Joint Petitioners' Joint Petition for Rehearing and Request for
OPC	Expedited Treatment.
RCA	Metalisticalists
SCR	RECEIVED & FILED
SGA	
SEC	EPSC-BUREAU OF RECORDS
ОТН	TIME.
	CKOYD DOOLWELD HEMPER-DATE

DOCUMENT NUMBER-CATE

01680 FEB 27 8

Blanca S. Bayo, Director
February 27, 2006
Page 2

Please acknowledge receipt of these documents by stamping the extra copy of this letter "filed" and returning the copy to me. Thank you for your assistance with this filing.

Sincerely,

Thomas A. Range

Florida Bar Number: 568651 **AKERMAN SENTERFITT**

Thomas a Range

106 East College Avenue, Suite 1200

Tallahassee, FL 32302-1877 Phone: (850) 224-9634 Fax: (850) 222-0103

Email: tom.range@akerman.com

Enclosures

BEFORE THE FLORIDA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of:	
Petition to Establish Generic Docket)	Docket No. 041269-TP
To Consider Amendments to)	Filed: February 27, 2006
Interconnection Agreements)	
Resulting from Changes of Law, by)	
BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc.)	
)	

JOINT PETITION FOR REHEARING AND REQUEST FOR EXPEDITED TREATMENT

Supra Telecommunications and Information Systems, Inc. ("Supra"), by and through its undersigned counsel, hereby files with the Florida Public Service Commission ("Commission") this Petition for Rehearing in Docket No. 041269-TP, Petition to Establish Generic Docket to Consider Amendments to Interconnection Agreements Resulting from Changes in Law, by BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc., ("the Generic Docket") on the joint behalf of Supra, Florida Digital Network, Inc., d/b/a FDN Communications ("FDN"), NuVox Communications, Inc. ("NuVox"), Xspedius Communications, LLC ("Xspedius"), and DIECA Communications, Inc. d/b/a Covad Communications Company ("Covad") (herein identified jointly as "Joint Petitioners"). The Joint Petitioners hereby submit this Petition pursuant to Rules 28-106.201 and 25-22.036, Florida Administrative Code, and in accordance with Rules 28-106.104 and 25-22.028, Florida Administrative Code. By this Petition, the Joint Petitioners respectfully request that the Commission initiate new evidentiary proceedings in this matter, which are necessary to correct a fundamental error in the assignment of Commissioners for the final resolution of this proceeding in violation of the provisions of Section 350.01(5), Florida Statutes.

0000MENT NUMBER-CATE
01680 FEB 278

FPSC-COMMISSION CLERK

Filed: February 27, 2006

The Commission is authorized to take such action in accordance with Rule 28-106.211, Florida Administrative Code, to effectuate the just resolution of this case, and such action would be entirely consistent with Section 120.68(7)(c), Florida Statutes. As grounds therefor and in support thereof, the Joint Petitioners state as follows:

Supra is a competitive local exchange carrier ("CLEC") certificated by the Commission 1. to provide telecommunications services within the State of Florida. Petitioner's name, address, and telephone number are as follows:

> Supra Telecommunications and Information Systems, Inc. 2901 S.W. 149th Avenue, Suite 300 Miramar, Florida 33027 (786) 455-4200

2. The Petitioner's representative's name, address, and telephone number is:

Marva Brown Johnson General Counsel Supra Telecommunications and Information 106 East College Avenue, Suite 1200 Systems, Inc. 2901 S.W. 149th Avenue, Suite 300 Miramar, Florida 33027 (786) 455-4209

Fax: (786) 455-4600

E-mail: Marva.Johnson@supratelecom.com

Thomas A. Range, Esquire AKERMAN SENTERFITT Tallahassee, FL 32302-1877

Phone: (850) 224-9634 Fax: (850) 222-0103

Email: tom.range@akerman.com

3. FDN is a competitive local exchange carrier ("CLEC") certificated by the Commission to provide telecommunications services within the State of Florida. Petitioner's name, address, and telephone number are as follows:

- 2 -{TL092425;1}

Section 120.68 (7)(c), provides, in pertinent part: "The court shall remand a case to the agency for further proceedings consistent with the court's decision or set aside agency action, as appropriate, when it finds that: . . . [t]he fairness of the proceedings or the correctness of the action may have been impaired by a material error in procedure or a failure to follow prescribed procedure. . . . "

Florida Digital Network, Inc. d/b/a FDN Communications 2301 Lucien Way, Suite 200 Maitland, Florida 32751

4. The Petitioner's representative's name, address, and telephone number is:

Matthew Feil General Counsel FDN Communications 2301 Lucien Way, Suite 200 Maitland, Florida 32751 (407) 835-0460 mfeil@mail.fdn.com

5. NuVox is a competitive local exchange carrier ("CLEC") certificated by the Commission to provide telecommunications services within the State of Florida. Petitioner's name, address, and telephone number are as follows:

NuVox Communications, Inc. Two North Main Street Greenville, South Carolina 29601

6. The Petitioner's representatives' name, address, and telephone number are:

Norman H. Horton, Jr. nhorton@lawfla.com Messer, Caparello & Self 215 S. Monroe St., Suite 701 Tallahassee, Florida 32301

P.O. Box 1876 Tallahassee, Florida 32302-1876 John Heitmann
jheitmann@kelleydrye.com
Garret R. Hargrave
ghargrave@kelleydrye.com
Kelley Drye & Warren,
LLP
Suite 500
1200 19th Street, NW
Washington, DC 20036

7. Xspedius is a competitive local exchange carrier ("CLEC") certificated by the Commission to provide telecommunications services within the State of Florida. Petitioner's name, address, and telephone number are as follows:

Xspedius Communications, LLC 5555 Winghaven Blvd., Suite 300 O'Fallon, Missouri 63366

8. The Petitioner's representatives' name, address, and telephone number are:

Norman H. Horton, Jr. nhorton@lawfla.com Messer, Caparello & Self 215 S. Monroe St., Suite 701 Tallahassee, Florida 32301

P.O. Box 1876 Tallahassee, Florida 32302-1876 John Heitmann
jheitmann@kelleydrye.com
Garret R. Hargrave
ghargrave@kelleydrye.com
Kelley Drye & Warren,
LLP
Suite 500
1200 19th Street, NW
Washington, DC 20036

9. Covad is a competitive local exchange carrier ("CLEC") certificated by the Commission to provide telecommunications services within the State of Florida. Petitioner's name, address, and telephone number are as follows:

Covad Communications Co. 1230 Peachtree Street, NE Suite 1900 Atlanta, Georgia 30309

10. The Petitioner's representatives' name, address, and telephone number are:

Charles (Gene) E. Watkins Covad Communications Co. 1230 Peachtree Street, NE Suite 1900 Atlanta, Georgia 30309 (404) 942-3492 GWatkins@Covad.com Vicki Gordon Kaufman Moyle Flanigan Katz Raymond & Sheehan, PA 118 North Gadsden Street Tallahassee, Florida 32301 (850) 681-3828 vkaufman@moylelaw.com

BellSouth is a corporation organized and formed under the laws of the state of Georgia, with its principal office at 675 West Peachtree Street, Atlanta, Georgia 30375. BellSouth is an Incumbent Local Exchange Carrier ("ILEC") certificated by this Commission to provide local

{TL092425;1} - 4 -

exchange telecommunications services in the State of Florida. BellSouth's address in the State of

Florida for service of process is:

Nancy B. White, General Counsel c/o Nancy H. Sims, Director of Regulatory Affairs BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. 150 South Monroe Street, Suite 400

Tallahassee, Florida 32301

Background

12. In response to the decision handed down in <u>United States Telecom Association v. FCC</u>,

decided March 2, 2004, 359 F. 3d 554 (D.C. Cir. 2004) ("USTA II"), the FCC 's Triennial

Review Order ("TRO") and Triennial Review Remand Order ("TRRO"), BellSouth filed on

November 1, 2004, its Petition to establish a generic docket to consider amendments to

interconnection agreements resulting from changes of law. Specifically, BellSouth asked that the

Commission determine what changes are required in existing, approved interconnection

agreements between BellSouth and CLECs in Florida as a result of changes in law.

13. The Commission promptly opened Docket No. 041269-TP to handle BellSouth's Petition.

Chairman Baez and Commissioners Deason, Bradley, Davidson, and Edgar were all originally

assigned to the panel.

14. On February 25, 2005, Supra requested to intervene as a party in this proceeding. That

request was granted by Order No. PSC-05-0267-PCO-TP.

15. Pursuant to Order No. PSC-05-0736-PCO-TP, Order Establishing Procedure, issued on

July 11, 2005, thirty-one (31) issues were identified for consideration and resolution by the

Commission.

 $\{TL092425;1\}$ - 5 -

- 16. On September 29, 2005, parties filed prehearing statements. Thereafter, the administrative hearing was conducted on November 2-4, 2005. A reduced panel of only three Commissioners participated, which consisted of Commissioners Deason, Edgar, and Arriaga.
- 17. Post-hearing briefs were filed on November 30, 2005. Six issues were resolved via negotiation.
- 18. The Commission staff filed its ultimate recommendation addressing the 25 issues that remained in dispute on January 26, 2006. Therein, staff recommended that the Commission reject the CLECs' arguments, including those put forth by Supra, in favor of either BellSouth's position, or some combination of BellSouth's and the CLECs' arguments. Notable exceptions were Issues 13 (commingling) and Issue 22(b), wherein the staff's recommendations appeared largely favorable to the CLEC positions.
- 19. On February 7, 2006, the Commission panel assigned considered the staff's recommendation. The panel was, again, limited to a panel of three, rather than the full Commission.

Count I - Proper Implementation of Section 350.01(5)

- 20. Section 350.01(5), Florida Statutes, states in pertinent part:
 - (5) . . . Only those commissioners assigned to a proceeding requiring hearings are entitled to participate in the final decision of the commission as to that proceeding; provided, if only two commissioners are assigned to a proceeding requiring hearings and cannot agree on a final decision, the chair shall cast the deciding vote for final disposition of the proceeding. If more than two commissioners are assigned to any proceeding, a majority of the members assigned shall constitute a quorum and a majority vote of the members assigned shall be essential to final commission disposition of those proceedings requiring actual participation by the commissioners. If a commissioner becomes unavailable after assignment to a particular proceeding, the chair shall assign a substitute commissioner. In those proceedings assigned to a

{TL092425;1} - 6 -

Filed: February 27, 2006

hearing examiner, following the conclusion of the hearings, the designated hearing examiner is responsible for preparing recommendations for final disposition by a majority vote of the commission. A petition for reconsideration shall be voted upon by those commissioners participating in the final disposition of the proceeding. [Emphasis added].

21. As noted herein, this proceeding was originally assigned to full panel, as is Commission practice when the matters to be addressed represent a case of first impression or are likely to include legal and policy decisions with far-reaching impacts. The original panel consisted of Chairman Baez and Commissioners Deason, Bradley, Davidson, and Edgar. The original panel participated in at least two substantive decisions involving this case.

22. Prior to the hearing in this matter, Commissioner Davidson left the Commission and was replaced on the panel by Commissioner Arriaga upon his appointment to the Commission. Sometime prior to October 18, 2005, Chairman Baez was removed from the panel assignment, as was Commissioner Deason. Thereafter, between October 18, 2005, and November 14, 2005, Commissioner Bradley was removed from the assigned panel, and Commissioner Deason was re-assigned to the panel.

- 23. As a result, only three Commissioners actually participated in the hearing of the case: Commissioner Edgar, Commissioner Deason, and Commissioner Arriaga. This same panel made the final vote. At the time of the hearing, however, there were five (5) active members of the Florida Public Service Commission.
- 24. While Supra recognizes that certain Commissioners were anticipating leaving the Commission by the end of the year, and appointments of new Commissioners had already been made, the fact of the matter is that the Commission had a full panel of Commissioners available to hear this matter. As such, the Commission had at least two options for properly addressing this situation in accordance with Section 350.01(5), Florida Statutes: (1) the Commission could

{TL092425;1} - 7 -

Filed: February 27, 2006

have assigned all five sitting Commissioners for the hearing, then required that the post hearing

filings and staff recommendation be expedited, and conducted a Special Agenda Conference for

purposes of consideration of this matter prior to Chairman Baez and Commissioner Bradley

leaving the Commission; or (2) the Commission could have conducted the hearing as scheduled,

but required that the new Commissioners read the record of the case to allow them to participate

in the decision on this Docket at the February 7, 2006, Agenda Conference.

25. As it stands, the case was decided by a panel of three Commissioners, even though two

Commissioners, Chairman Edgar and Commissioner Arriaga, expressed regret at the February 7.

2006, Agenda Conference that a full panel of the sitting Commissioners was not available to

consider the matter in view of the far-reaching impacts.

26. The Commission has the ability to remedy this error in procedure, but at this late stage in

the proceeding, and with the March 11, 2006, deadline looming ever closer, can accomplish this

task in only two realistic ways: (1) the Commission can vacate its decisions made at the February

7, 2006, Agenda Conference, reopen the record, conduct an expedited hearing involving all five

sitting Commissioners based only upon evidence already submitted, and require an oral staff

recommendation with a bench vote; or (2) the Commission can vacate its decisions made at the

February 7, 2006, Agenda Conference, reopen the record to allow summations² and closing

arguments by counsel for the parties, require Commissioners Carter and Tew to read the record

in its entirety, require that a new recommendation be circulated addressing all issues, and require

a Special Agenda for consideration of the new recommendation be conducted prior to the March

11, 2006, TRO/TRRO transition date.

27. The Joint Petitioners submit that both of these options are completely reasonable,

particularly in view of the state-wide economic impact that the decisions on these issues will

² The Joint Petitioners contemplate reliance upon the record as it currently stands.

-8-{TL092425;1}

Filed: February 27, 2006

have.³ Implementation of a remedy is, in fact, necessary in accordance with Section 350.01(5),

Florida Statutes.⁴ Furthermore, in view of the incidents of inappropriate conduct by former

Commission staff member Doris Moss, remedial action to address the procedural error identified

herein is simply the prudent thing to do.

28. Counsel for the Joint Petitioners identified herein have stated their support of this

Petition. Counsel for BellSouth has indicated that BellSouth is opposed.

RELIEF REQUESTED

For all of the foregoing reasons, the Joint Petitioners request that the Commission take

any or all of the following actions as appropriate:

(1) Vacate the post-hearing decision made in this Docket at the February 7, 2006, Agenda

Conference, and provide a rehearing involving all five Commissioners by one of the expedited

means outlined in Count I of this Petition; and

(2) Implement any and all such other relief as may be necessary and appropriate to remedy the

errors and irregularities identified herein.

{TL092425;1} - 9 -

³ Furthermore, in anticipation of any claim of administrative finality, neither option is preclude by the administrative law doctrine. See McCaw Communications of Florida, Inc., Appellant vs. Susan F. Clark, 679 So. 2d 1177 (Fla. 1996) (cautioning that agencies should not take "too doctrinaire" an approach to the application of the doctrine of administrative finality.)

⁴ In Order No. PSC-03-0951-FOF-TP, the Commission recognized that Section 350.01 requires assignment of a replacement Commissioner. While the Commission concluded in that Order that a panel of four was acceptable in that case, because a Commissioner had resigned and a replacement had not yet been appointed, this case is different because there were five sitting Commissioners at the time of the hearing in this Docket.

Respectfully submitted this 27th day of February, 2006.

Supra Telecommunications and Information Systems, Inc.

Thomas A. Range

Florida Bar Number: 568651 AKERMAN SENTERFITT

106 East College Avenue, Suite 1200

Tallahassee, FL 32302-1877 Phone: (850) 224-9634

Fax: (850) 222-0103

Email: tom.range@akerman.com

Marva Brown Johnson, General Counsel Supra Telecommunications and Information Systems, Inc. 2901 S.W. 149th Avenue, Suite 300 Miramar, Florida 33027 (786) 455-4209

Fax: (786) 455-4600

E-mail: Marva.Johnson@supratelecom.com

on behalf of the Joint Petitioners:

Supra Telecommunications and Information Systems, Inc. 2901 S.W. 149 th Avenue, Suite 300 Miramar, Florida 33027	FDN Communications 2301 Lucien Way, Suite 200 Maitland, Florida 32751	Nuvox /NewSouth Two North Main Street Greenville, South Carolina 29601
Xspedius Communications, LLC 5555 Winghaven Blvd., Suite 300 O'Fallon, Missouri 63366		Covad Communications Co. 1230 Peachtree Street, NE Suite 1900 Atlanta, Georgia 30309

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that a true and correct copy of the foregoing has been served via Electronic Mail* and U.S. Mail First Class to the persons listed below this 27th day of February, 2006:

Alan C. Gold, P.A. *

Alan C. Gold/James L. Parado

Gables One Tower

1320 South Dixie Highway, Suite 870

Coral Gables, FL 33146 Phone: (305) 667-0475 FAX: (305) 663-0799

Email: agold@kcl.net/jlp@kcl.net

AT&T Communications of the Southern

States, LLC (05) Tracy Hatch, Esq.

101 North Monroe Street, Suite 700

Tallahassee, FL 32301 Phone: (850) 425-6360 FAX: (832) 213-0204

AT&T

Sonia Daniels

1230 Peachtree Street, NE

4th Floor

Atlanta, GA 30309 Phone: 404-810-8488

Azul Tel, Inc.

2200 South Dixie Highway, Suite 506

Miami, FL 33133-2300 Phone: (786) 497-4050 FAX: (786) 497-4057

BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. * N.White/D.Lackey/E.Edenfield/M.Mays J. Meza c/o Ms. Nancy H. Sims 150 South Monroe Street, Suite 400 Tallahassee, FL 32301-1556

Phone: 850-577-5555 FAX: 222-8640

Email: nancy.sims@bellsouth.com nancy.white@bellsouth.com

Covad Communications Company * Charles (Gene) Watkins

1230 Peachtree Street NE, Suite 1900

Atlanta, GA 30309 Phone: (404) 942-3492 FAX: (404) 942-3495

Email: GWatkins@Covad.com

Casey Law Firm * Bill Magness

98 San Jacinto Blvd., Suite 1400

Austin, TX 78701 Phone: 512-480-9900 FAX: 512-480-9200

Email: bmagness@phonelaw.com

FCCA/CompSouth (Moyle) * Vicki Gordon Kaufman c/o Moyle Law Firm 118 North Gadsden Street Tallahassee, FL 32301

Phone: 850-681-3828

FAX: 681-8788

Email: vkaufman@moylelaw.com

- 11 -{TL092425;1}

FDN Communications * Matthew Feil, Esq. 2301 Lucien Way, Suite 200

Maitland, FL 32751 Phone: (407) 835-0460 FAX: (407) 835-0309

Email: mfeil@mail.fdn.com

ITC^DeltaCom Ms. Nanette Edwards 7037 Old Madison Pike, Suite 400 Huntsville, AL 35806

Phone: (256) 382-3856 FAX: (256) 382-3936

MCImetro Access Transmission Services LLC Ms. Donna C. McNulty 1203 Governors Square Blvd., Suite 201 Tallahassee, FL 32301-2960

Phone: (850) 219-1008 FAX: 219-1018

Email: donna.mcnulty@mci.com

Moyle Law Firm (06) * Vicki Gordon Kaufman 118 North Gadsden Street Tallahassee, FL 32301 Phone: 850-681-3828

FAX: 681-8788

Email: vkaufman@moylelaw.com

GRUCom *

Raymond O. Manasco, Jr.

P. O. Box 147117, Station A-138 Gainesville, FL 32614-7117

Phone: 352-393-1010 FAX: 352-334-2277

Email: manascoro@gru.com

MCI *

Dulaney O'Roark III, Esq. 6 Concourse Parkway

Suite 600

Atlanta, GA 30328 Phone: 770-284-5498 Email: de.oroark@mci.com

Messer Law Firm * Floyd R. Self P. O. Box 1876

Tallahassee, FL 32302-1876

Phone: 850-222-0720 FAX: 224-4359

Email: fself@lawfla.com

NuVox/NewSouth/Xspedius/KMC Telecom

(Kelley) *

J.Heitmann/B.Mutschelknaus/S.Kassman

c/o Kelley Law Firm

1200 19th St., NW, Suite 500

Washington, DC 20036 Phone: 202-877-1254

FAX: 202-955-9792

Email:

JHeitman@KelleyDrye.com/SKassman@K

elleyDrye.com

Norman H. Horton, Jr. * c/o Messer Law Firm P.O. Box 1876 Tallahassee, FL 32302-1876

Phone: 850-222-0720

FAX: 224-4359

Email: nhorton@lawfla.com

SECCA/US LEC Wanda Montano/Terry Romine 6801 Morrison Blvd. Charlotte, NC 28211 Phone: 704-319-1119

FAX: 704-602-1119

Squire, Sanders Law Firm * Charles A. Guyton 215 South Monroe Street, Suite 601 Tallahassee, FL 32301-1804

Phone: 850-222-2300 FAX: 222-8410

Email: cguyton@ssd.com

Sutherland Law Firm (Tall) * C. Everett Boyd, Jr. 3600 Maclay Boulevard S., Suite 202 Tallahassee, FL 32312-1267

Phone: 850-907-2500 FAX: 907-2501

Email: everett.boyd@sablaw.com

The Helein Law Group, LLP * Jonathan S. Marashlian, Esq. 8180 Greensboro Drive, Suite 700

McLean, VA 22102 Phone: 703-714-1313 FAX: 703-714-1330

Email: jsm@thlglaw.com

Rutledge Law Firm * K.Hoffman/M.McDonnell/M.Rule

P.O. Box 551

Tallahassee, FL 32302 Phone: 850-681-6788 FAX: 681-6515

Email: marsha@reuphlaw.com

Sprint Nextel/Sprint LP * William R. Atkinson 3065 Cumberland Circle Atlanta, GA 30339 Phone: 404-649-4882 FAX: 404-649-1652

Email: facsimilebill.atkinson@sprint.com

STS Telecom * 12233 S.W. 55th Street, #811

Cooper City, FL 33330-3303

Phone: (954) 434-7388 FAX: (954) 680-2506

Email: jkrutchik@ststelecom.com

David Adelman *

999 Peachtree Street, NE Atlanta, GA 30309 Phone: 404-853-8206

FAX: 404-853-8806

Email: david.adelman@sablaw.com

WilTel Local Network, LLC * Adam Kupetsky One Technology Center (TC-15)

100 South Cincinnati Tulsa, OK 74103

Phone: 918-547-2764 FAX: 918-547-9446

Email: adam.kupetsky@wiltel.com

XO Communications, Inc. 105 Molloy Street, Suite 300 Nashville, TN 37201

Phone: 615-777-7700 FAX: 615-850-0343

Adam Teitzman and *
Kira Scott
Florida Public Service Commission,
Division of Legal Services
2540 Shumard Oak Blvd., Tallahassee, FL
32399-0850

By:

Thomas A. Range

Florida Bar Number: 568651 **AKERMAN SENTERFITT**

106 East College Avenue, Suite 1200

Thomas L Range

Tallahassee, FL 32302-1877 Phone: (850) 224-9634 Fax: (850) 222-0103

Email: tom.range@akerman.com

Marva Brown Johnson, General Counsel SUPRA TELECOMMUNICATIONS AND INFORMATION SYSTEMS, INC. 2901 SW 149TH Ave., Suite 300 Miramar, FL 33027